

BETHLEHEM CITY COUNCIL MEETING
10 East Church Street - Town Hall
Bethlehem, Pennsylvania
Tuesday, January 15, 2019 - 7:00 PM

INVOCATION

Minister Mable Humphrey, Grace Deliverance Baptist Church, offered the Invocation which was followed by the pledge to the flag.

PLEDGE TO THE FLAG

1. ROLL CALL

President Waldron called the meeting to order. Present were Bryan G. Callahan, Michael G. Colón, Shawn M. Martell, Olga Negrón, J. William Reynolds, Paige Van Wirt, and Adam R. Waldron, 7.

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

The Minutes from December 18, 2018 and January 2, 2019 were approved.

3. PUBLIC COMMENT (on any subject not being voted on this evening - 5 minutes time limit)

Fair Funding Formula Resolution

Michael Faccineto, 3222 Marchant Drive, informed he is at this meeting to thank Councilman Reynolds for introducing the Resolution dealing with the fair funding formula. He is the President of the Bethlehem Area School District Board and pointed out Board Member Dr. Beck-Pooley and a parent from our BASD Proud Parent group are also in attendance. He informed Bethlehem is the sixth largest district in Pennsylvania and they have a \$285 to \$290 million dollar budget which is currently being discussed for this year. He explained that 71% of that budget is funded by local taxpayers, that is businesses and residents who live in the City of Bethlehem, Fountain Hill, Freemansburg, Bethlehem Township and Hanover Township. He remarked they have seen an increase in State funding of only \$5.5 million dollars since 2011 while property taxes have increased over \$28 million dollars. In Bethlehem the average cost per student is \$13,785 dollars. Bethlehem Area School District is 253rd out of 500 districts for funding per student. Mr. Faccineto highlighted this is not just a Bethlehem problem. He noted that Allentown is the third largest district and only 35% of their revenue comes from local taxpayers. He explained that Easton gets about 68% from local taxpayers. He expressed, something that the Resolution is dealing with, and an effort around the Commonwealth lately is equitable and fair funding, has been a fair funding formula that has been in place for a few years now, but only new money goes to that. He explained the existing money that was in the system up until 2015, 2016, is what the school districts receive, then any new money that the Governor proposed goes to the new funding formula. If all the money went through the funding formula which we have been talking about, not doing this overnight, but over the course of maybe four or five budget years to help out the smaller districts who would be getting less money, Bethlehem would get between

\$21 and \$25 million dollars extra every year. He continued to say they started the year with an \$11 million dollar budget deficit so you can see what \$25 million dollars would do. Mr. Faccinnetto remarked Allentown would receive almost \$70 million extra dollars; Easton would receive over \$5 million dollars of new funding. He asserted there is definitely a need to see the fair funding formula used to its fullest extent to push money through it. We see the City of Bethlehem, the School District, and the Township all in partnership because when our students succeed, and we can deliver a high quality workforce, businesses will want to invest in the community. He referenced the future of the Sands, who are looking for 400 to 500 new workers and whether those are skilled trades or white collar jobs running the operation, the School District and the Vo-Tech, are ones who can provide the jobs. Mr. Faccinnetto stressed having a fully funded school system that does not rely so much on the backs of local taxpayers is something we all desire. He thanked Councilman Reynolds for the Resolution and encouraged all on Council to support it. He concluded saying hopefully this can get us down the path where we need to be, not just for Bethlehem but for many districts throughout this Commonwealth.

Women's March, Saturday, January 19, 2019

Karen Hicks, 135 East Market Street, informed she came to this meeting to invite everyone to come to the third Women's March in Payrow Plaza on Saturday, January 19, 2019 from 10:00 am to 1:00 pm. She informed this year's event is being organized by a Liberty High School student that she has been working with and mentoring into becoming a person who will continue throughout her life to work on behalf of social justice issues. Ms. Hicks explained Congresswoman Susan Wild is one of the speakers and there will be around 15 speakers. There is a Facebook page called Women's March Bethlehem 2019 and this list of speaker and more information will be one the page. She encourages everyone to come out and support the Women's March.

Crime on Third Street

Fady Mobader informed he is owner of the Sultana Hookah Lounge since 2012 on Third Street, and expressed that lately he has been losing a lot of business due to things happening near his business. He referenced the H20 Hookah Lounge and a shooting last December. He noted his customers refuse to come to his business on the weekends because of that and two waitresses quit at the beginning of the year because of safety concerns. Mr. Mobader is thinking of packing and leaving because his safety and his family's safety is very important. He informed there are many drunken people crossing the street from the parking lots to the H20 Hookah Lounge. He used to have family dropping their kids off to his place and they pick them up later on but that does not happen anymore. He pointed out a lot of Lehigh students do not come to Third Street anymore and his sales have dropped since last May almost 50%. Mr. Mobader does not know what to do. He deals with a lot of dangerous people because if they do not get into the H20 Hookah Lounge they come to his place and get angry when he does not let them inside. Mr. Mobader stressed he cannot survive as a business owner with this happening and wanted to explain to Council what is occurring on Third Street.

President Waldron explained another speaker came to the last Council Meeting regarding the same matter and he encouraged Mr. Mobader to speak to the Police Chief because the Chief can speak to what they can do to work together to help solve some of those problems.

Courtesy of the Floor

Stephen Antalics, 737 Ridge Street, mentioned following up on an exchange which occurred at the last Council Meeting he pointed to the Bethlehem Authority and the other is the Bethlehem Area School District regarding Courtesy of the Floor and noted they are citizen friendly. By that he means that if a person says something in Courtesy to the Floor and someone on the Authority or Board disagrees they might voice their disagreement and the person who made the statement is allowed to respond if they feel that response is incorrect. Mr. Antalics stated at City Council once that timer light goes to zero, you are required to sit down and if anyone on Council disagrees what was said they will voice their opinion. That opinion might be correct or it might be incorrect but the person here speaking cannot address the issue after the zero appears on that timer, which he thinks is unfair. If people on Council take umbrage with anything said at this podium he thinks that Council should allow them to respond briefly at best to refute what the difference might be. Mr. Antalics commented he was quite taken aback at a recent meeting where a Member of Council addressed a private citizen in an unsavory way and felt that was uncalled for. He continued to say Council should be careful to differentiate between First Amendment rights and subjective comments where a private citizen is addressed in that manner. In his estimation there have been a number of exchanges which cross a line. Mr. Antalics thinks Council President should err on the right side and use the gavel rather than allow these exchanges to happen because these exchanges seem to go back and forth. He believes the First Amendment right is almost lost because it is really getting into personalities.

4. PUBLIC COMMENT (on ordinances and resolutions to be voted on by Council this evening - 5 Minute Time Limit)

Fair Funding Resolution

Julie Gallagher, 1940 Fernway Avenue, explained she is at this meeting as one of the founding members of a parent advocacy group called the BASD Proud Parents. She highlighted her daughter, who attends Nitschmann Middle School, is with her tonight and Ms. Gallagher also has a son who attends James Buchanan Elementary School. She is at this meeting to speak for herself and for one of her BASD Proud Parents co-founders Emily Schenkel who could not be in attendance due her coaching one of the boys' basketball teams. She pointed out they are parents who are deeply involved in our schools. Ms. Gallagher noted one of the reasons they started this group two years ago was because they loved what was happening in their schools and felt so much of the message that gets put out in the newspapers is negative. They wanted to be a counter voice to that to help spread the reasons why as parents they are not just proud, but why they have chosen the Bethlehem Public School District for their children. When she saw the magic that happens in our schools every day she realized she had no idea of what was happening in Harrisburg and wanted to speak up, educate herself and others, and become involved in education policy discussions. The first advocacy was text messages saying there is a piece of legislation being discussed in Harrisburg. Initially there were nine parents and they talked to other parents and that grew to 50 students and now a couple of 100 students are involved. She expressed this had occurred because they are very committed to what is happening in this school district. Ms. Gallagher noted this is all being done by teachers who are extraordinarily dedicated. She thanked Councilman Reynolds for his Fair Funding Formula Resolution and urged all Members of Council to support the Resolution. She noted every child deserves to have teachers

who are so enthusiastically helping kids learn to play the flute in the morning and then teach them how to ski down Blue Mountain in the afternoons. Ms. Gallagher noted they have a very talented member of our group who has put together not only a website, but brochures, and they would like to leave that with City Council. She explained that Ms. Schenkel's children go to Thomas Jefferson and Ms. Schenkel stated "They are receiving an amazing education by devoted and passionate teachers, supportive staff and administrators. They go to school with wonderful children from our local community and every one of them deserves the benefits to be received from Fair Funding." Ms. Gallagher expressed thanks on behalf of the BASD Proud Parents group and urged Council to support the Resolution.

Karen Beck-Pooley, 331 Prospect Avenue informed she is a member of the Bethlehem Area School Board and is also a member of BASD Proud Parents. She thanked Councilman Reynolds for putting forward the Fair Funding Formula Resolution and urged Council to vote for it. The Fair Funding Resolution stresses pushing all State funding through it and allocating based education funding in a manner that the formula proposes that came out of years-worth of thought around how to get dollars to students in the most equitable way. That would create a far more equitable system than we have in a much shorter timeframe than we are currently looking at. Ms. Beck-Pooley explained Pennsylvania currently, across all States, has the widest gap between poor and wealthy districts in terms of how much funding goes to individual students in those schools. We also rank 46th out of 50 States, in terms of how many State dollars go to support public education. Ms. Beck-Pooley noted this change, as proposed in Council's Resolution, would bring \$21 to \$25 million dollars to the Bethlehem Area School District and go a long way to supporting some incredible programs we have. She remarked there is the national recognized literacy program, Reading by Third Grade, Career Pathways in the high schools and all sorts of incredible things across the board. Ms. Beck-Pooley additionally is asking Council to please not to stop there. They have had the benefit of collaborating on a number of projects that benefit both our schools and our communities and to continue this collaboration between our public schools and our City, and asks Council to continue thinking about other kinds of public school policies that would be beneficial to the Bethlehem Area School District and other school districts across the Commonwealth. What would also be incredibly powerful for our district is real meaningful reform around pensions and also around Charter school laws. Ms. Beck-Pooley communicated the district's preliminary budget for the upcoming year has the cost of tuition payments at nearly \$31 million dollars which represents 94% of the State funding our district receives. She noted nearly all of our State funding is going immediately out the door to Charter Schools which represents our district but requires some additional support from the State if we will have all of these options for our students. Ms. Beck-Pooley asserted the more we can collaborate as a City and a school district and the more we can get the good word out about public education in our public schools here in Bethlehem which really are stupendous, the better.

Boards and Authorities Appointments

Bruce Haines, 63 West Church Street informed he is at this meeting to ask Council to take a serious look at the Administrative Orders that are on the agenda tonight of people being recommended by the Mayor. These are positions on many different Boards and Authorities within the City. From his experience in coming to Council Meetings in the past he has never heard Council challenge one appointment. He might be wrong and this may have happened once but he can say from his perspective these Boards and Authorities are significant.

President Waldron noted the BRIA appointment we are considering this evening is because of exactly that.

Mr. Haines complimented Council on what they did with the first reappointment two meetings ago. He expressed that these Boards have significant authority in this City that never comes back to Council and when they mess up it requires the citizens to have to put up a lot of money to correct the problems. Mr. Haines remarked the Zoning Hearing Board, the CRIZ Board and the Parking Authority are three entities in this City that have a lot of power. He has no idea if this new person being appointed to BRIA has any conflicts of interest or not, but he can say there are serious conflicts of interests in those three entities. Mr. Haines stated President Waldron put his faith in the Zoning Hearing Board in the vote that he made on 2 West Market Street. That is the same Zoning Hearing Board that reversed their decision without any change in facts that ultimately ended up being overturned 3-0 by the Commonwealth Court. Mr. Haines noted the Parking Authority has issues as does the CRIZ; these are all very powerful Boards where their decisions never come back to Council. Mr. Haines noted it is not like the HARB where you get to approve what they do or disapprove as you have done recently. He expressed there are Boards that are perfunctory; there are not major decisions made by these Boards that go back to Council for some degree of check and balance against the Administration. He thinks BRIA, the Parking Authority and the Zoning Hearing Board deserve some serious investigation on the part of Council. Mr. Haines encourages Council to continue on the path that they took in appointing a new person on the CRIZ Board.

Fair Funding Formula Resolution

Stephen Antalics, 737 Ridge Street, stated he would like to follow up on comments made by Mrs. Gallagher. He reflected on the School District years ago and expressed it was a dysfunctional system with financial problems and scores were down. Today there is united Board of Directors and it is run as an organization to improve education and that is what they have done and under difficult circumstances. He expressed there are some good Charter Schools but some are questionable. Mr. Antalics noted when real estate developers start promoting Charter Schools that is a red flag. He continued to say State laws, with its loopholes, allow Charter Schools to drain money from the School District that the District really needs. This year it is projected that Charter Schools will cost the District \$30,751,000 dollars which is a lot of money and deprives the School District children of the education they should be getting. Mr. Antalics stressed that fact alone makes this Resolution a no-brainer; you are almost obliged to approve it based on the facts. He expects a 7-0 vote on that Resolution and he thinks if that does happen then Council is voting in the best interest of the School District.

- A. Members of Council
- B. Tabled Items
- C. Unfinished Business

6. COMMUNICATIONS

- A. *Councilman Reynolds – Support Resolution – Fair Funding Formula for Pennsylvania Schools*

The Clerk read a memorandum dated January 8, 2019 from Councilman J. William Reynolds to which is attached a proposed Resolution encouraging the Commonwealth of

Pennsylvania to enact legislation making the distribution of State education funding more equitable by reducing per-pupil funding disparities between poorer and wealthier districts.

President Waldron stated 10 A is on the agenda.

- B. *Director of Water and Sewer Resources – Recommendation of Award – Material Matters, Inc. – Biosolids Beneficial Use Program Consulting Services*

The Clerk read a memorandum dated January 2, 2019 from Edward J. Boscola, Director of Water and Sewer Resources recommending a contract with Material Matters, Inc. for the Biosolids Beneficial Use Program Consulting Services. The term of the contract is from the Notice to Proceed until December 31, 2019 with five annual renewals by mutual agreement. The fee for the contract is estimated at \$40,000.

President Waldron stated Resolution 10 B is on the agenda.

- C. *Director of Water and Sewer Resources – Recommendation of Award – S. C. Engineers, Inc. – 2019 Annual Consulting Services*

The Clerk read a memorandum dated January 2, 2019 from Edward J. Boscola, Director of Water and Sewer Resources recommending a contract with S. C. Engineers, Inc., for the 2019 Annual Consulting Services for the Industrial Pretreatment Program and Miscellaneous Assignments. The term of the contract is January 1, 2019 to December 31, 2019. The fee for the contract is not to exceed \$20,000.

President Waldron stated Resolutions 10 C is on the agenda.

- D. *Director of Water and Sewer Resources – Recommendation of Award – Van Cleef Engineering Associates, LLC – Evaluation, Design and Construction Management – Replacement of Wild Creek Intake Tower Link Elements*

The Clerk read a memorandum dated January 2, 2019 from Edward J. Boscola, Director of Water and Sewer Resources recommending a contract with Van Cleef Engineering Associates, LLC for the Evaluation, the Design and Construction Management for Replacement of Wild Creek Intake Tower Link Elements. The term of the contract is from the Notice to Proceed until December 31, 2019. The fee for the contract is \$22,500.

President Waldron stated Resolution 10 D is on the agenda.

- E. *Director of Water and Sewer Resources – Recommendation of Award – Keystone Engineering Group, Inc. – WWPT Effluent Pump Station Electrical Controls Upgrade*

The Clerk read a memorandum dated January 2, 2019 from Edward J. Boscola, Director of Water and Sewer Resources recommending a contract with Keystone Engineering Group, Inc. for the Waste Water Treatment Plant Effluent Pump Station Electrical Controls Upgrade. The term of the contract is from the Notice to Proceed until December 31, 2019. The fee for the contract is \$24,000.

President Waldron stated Resolution 10 E is on the agenda.

- F. *Director of Water and Sewer Resources – Recommendation of Award – Steven G. Lowry & Associates, Inc. – 2019 Annual Engineering Services*

The Clerk read a memorandum dated January 2, 2019 from Edward J. Boscola, Director of Water and Sewer Resources recommending a contract with Steven G. Lowry & Associates, Inc. for the 2019 Annual Engineering Services for Department of Water & Sewer Resources Water Engineering. The term for the contract is January 1, 2019 to December 31, 2019. The fee for the contract is \$65,000 with two additional yearly renewal options.

President Waldron stated Resolution 10 F is on the agenda.

- G. *Director of Water and Sewer Resources – Recommendation of Award – Gannett Fleming Valuation and Rate Consultants, LLC – Customer Class Demand Study*

The Clerk read a memorandum dated January 2, 2019 from Edward J. Boscola, Director of Water and Sewer Resources recommending a contract with Gannett Fleming Valuation and Rate Consultants, LLC for the Customer Class Demand Study. The term of the contract is from the Notice to Proceed until February 28, 2020. The fee for the contract is \$60,000.

President Waldron stated Resolution 10 G is on the agenda.

- H. *Director of Water and Sewer Resources – Recommendation of Award – Emerson Process Management Power & Water Solutions, Inc. – 2019 Licensed Software Support for SCADA System*

The Clerk read a memorandum dated January 2, 2019 from Edward J. Boscola, Director of Water and Sewer Resources recommending a contract with Emerson Process Management Power & Water Solutions, Inc. for the 2019 Licensed Software Support for SCADA System at the Water Treatment Plant, Water Distribution Control, and Wastewater Treatment Plant. The term of the contract is January 1, 2019 to December 31, 2019. The fee for the contract is \$43,901.28 and \$159 per hour and cost of expenses plus 10% for support services on an as needed basis.

President Waldron stated Resolution 10 H is on the agenda.

- I. *Director of Water and Sewer Resources – Recommendation of Award – Gannett Fleming Valuation and Rate Consultants, LLC – Update of Capital Value and Depreciation of City Water System*

The Clerk read a memorandum dated January 2, 2019 from Edward J. Boscola, Director of Water and Sewer Resources recommending a contract with Gannett Fleming Valuation and Rate Consultants, LLC for the Update of Capital Value and Depreciation of the City's Water System. The term of the contract is from the Notice to Proceed until April 30, 2019. The fee for the contract is \$5,800 with a renewal for up to four additional one year terms with mutual consent of the City.

President Waldron stated Resolution 10 I is on the agenda.

J. Director of Community and Economic Development – Recommendation of Award –Triad Associates – Community Development Consulting

The Clerk read a memorandum dated January 3, 2019 from Alicia Karner, Director of Community and Economic Development recommending a contract with Triad Associates for Community Development Consulting including preparation of plan and reports for HUD and preparation of the 2020 Consolidated Plan for HUD. The term of the contract is one year with two one-year extension options. The fee for the contract is \$40,800.

President Waldron stated Resolution 10 J is on the agenda.

K. Purchasing Director – On-Line Auction

The Clerk read a memorandum date January 7, 2019 from Sandra Steidel, Director of Purchasing to which is attached a list of vehicles to be sold at the next on-line auction to be held within the next 60 days.

President Waldron stated if Council has no objection the property listed; the same may be added to the on-line auction. If Council would like to discuss a specific item, the same shall be removed from the list and discussed at the next Council Meeting on Tuesday, February 5, 2019. President Waldron queried if any Member of Council would like to discuss a specific item, have it removed from the list, and discussed at the next City Council Meeting on Tuesday, February 5, 2019.

President Waldron stated a memo will be sent to the Purchasing Director that City Council has no objections to the property listed.

L. Director of Budget and Finance – Cash Balance Transfer Resolution – 9-1-1 Funds

The Clerk read a memorandum dated January 9, 2019 from Mark W. Sivak, Director of Budget & Finance to which is attached a proposed Resolution to satisfy any requirements under the Third Class City Code for the transfer of \$2,075,000 in 9-1-1 funds from the 9-1-1 Fund into the Non-Utility Capital Budget Fund that was approved as part of the 2019 Budget.

President Waldron stated Resolution 10 K is on the agenda.

M. Director of Budget and Finance – Cash Balance Transfer Resolution – Excess Gaming Funds

The Clerk read a memorandum dated January 9, 2019 from Mark W. Sivak, Director of Budget & Finance to which is attached a proposed Resolution to satisfy any requirements under the Third Class City Code for the transfer of \$2,468,000 one-time excess gaming funds from the General Fund into the Non-Utility Capital Fund that was approved as part of the 2019 Budget.

President Waldron stated Resolution 10 L is on the agenda.

N. Business Administrator – 9-1-1 Agreements with Northampton County

The Clerk read a memorandum dated January 10, 2019 from Eric Evans, Business Administrator to which is attached a proposed Memorandum of Understanding regarding transfer of ownership of a trunked radio network and the proposed Ordinance; an Agreement of Sale for equipment and related components and a proposed Resolution; and a Communications Site Lease for use on our existing towers and a proposed Resolution, all in connection with the transition of 9-1-1 operations from the City of Bethlehem to Northampton County. The identical documents are also being considered by Northampton County Council.

President Waldron stated he will refer this to the Public Safety Committee.

O. *Director of Community and Economic Development – Recommendation of Award – David Weiner Design – Christmas Lighting/ Decor Design Project*

The Clerk read a memorandum from Alicia Karner, Director of Community and Economic Development recommending a contract with David Weiner Design to develop a comprehensive phased Christmas lighting and décor proposal for the City. The term of the contract is six months from time of contract execution. The fee for the contract is \$35,000.

President Waldron stated Resolution 10 M is on the agenda.

7. REPORTS

A. *President of Council*

Live Streaming

President Waldron related our video recording went off very well after the last meeting and barring any technical setbacks we are set to go live starting at the next meeting on February 5, 2019.

B. *Mayor*

1. *Administrative Order – Mark P. Jobes – Bethlehem Revitalization and Improvement Authority*

Eric Evans, Business Administrator, read Mayor Donchez' appointment of Mark P. Jobes to membership on the Bethlehem Revitalization and Improvement Authority effective through October, 2023. Mr. Reynolds and Dr. Van Wirt sponsored Resolution No. 2019-007 to confirm the appointment.

Voting AYE: Ms. Negrón, Mr. Reynolds, Dr. Van Wirt, Mr. Callahan, Mr. Colón, Mr. Martell, and Mr. Waldron, 7. The Resolution passed.

2. *Administrative Order – Maureen Leeson Pany – Recreation Board*

Eric Evans, Business Administrator, read Mayor Donchez' reappointment of Maureen Leeson Pany to membership on the Recreation Board effective through January, 2024. Mr. Reynolds and Dr. Van Wirt sponsored Resolution No. 2019-008 to confirm the reappointment.

Voting AYE: Ms. Negrón, Mr. Reynolds, Dr. Van Wirt, Mr. Callahan, Mr. Colón, Mr. Martell, and Mr. Waldron, 7. The Resolution passed.

3. *Administrative Order – Irene Follweiler – Recreation Board*

Eric Evans, Business Administrator, read Mayor Donchez' reappointment of Irene Follweiler to membership on the Recreation Board effective through January, 2024. Mr. Reynolds and Dr. Van Wirt sponsored Resolution No. 2019-009 to confirm the reappointment.

Voting AYE: Ms. Negrón, Mr. Reynolds, Dr. Van Wirt, Mr. Callahan, Mr. Colón, Mr. Martell, and Mr. Waldron, 7. The Resolution passed.

4. *Administrative Order – Robin Metzler – Recreation Board*

Eric Evans, Business Administrator, read Mayor Donchez' reappointment of Robin Metzler to membership on the Recreation Board effective through January, 2024. Mr. Reynolds and Dr. Van Wirt sponsored Resolution No. 2019-010 to confirm the reappointment.

Voting AYE: Ms. Negrón, Mr. Reynolds, Dr. Van Wirt, Mr. Callahan, Mr. Colón, Mr. Martell, and Mr. Waldron, 7. The Resolution passed.

5. *Administrative Order – Roger Hudak – Historic Conservation Commission-South Bethlehem/Mount Airy*

Eric Evans, Business Administrator, read Mayor Donchez' reappointment of Roger Hudak to membership on the Historic Conservation Commission-South Bethlehem/Mount Airy effective through January, 2022. Ms. Negrón and Mr. Reynolds sponsored Resolution No. 2019-011 to confirm the reappointment.

Voting AYE: Ms. Negrón, Mr. Reynolds, Dr. Van Wirt, Mr. Callahan, Mr. Colón, Mr. Martell, and Mr. Waldron, 7. The Resolution passed.

6. *Administrative Order – Lynn Collins Cunningham – Bethlehem Parking Authority*

Eric Evans, Business Administrator, read Mayor Donchez' reappointment of Lynn Collins Cunningham to membership on the Bethlehem Parking Authority effective through January, 2024. Mr. Reynolds and Dr. Van Wirt sponsored Resolution No. 2019-012 to confirm the reappointment.

Voting AYE: Ms. Negrón, Mr. Reynolds, Dr. Van Wirt, Mr. Callahan, Mr. Colón, Mr. Martell, and Mr. Waldron, 7. The Resolution passed.

7. *Administrative Order – Thomas Donchez – Bethlehem Authority*

Eric Evans, Business Administrator, read Mayor Donchez' reappointment of Thomas Donchez to membership on the Bethlehem Authority effective through January, 2024. Mr. Reynold and Dr. Van Wirt sponsored Resolution No. 2019-013 to confirm the reappointment.

Voting AYE: Ms. Negrón, Mr. Reynolds, Dr. Van Wirt, Mr. Callahan, Mr. Colón, Mr. Martell, and Mr. Waldron, 7. The Resolution passed.

8. *Administrative Order – Jessica Lee – Fine Arts Commission*

Eric Evans, Business Administrator, ready mayor Donchez' reappointment of Jessica Lee to membership on the Fine Arts Commission effective through December, 2021. Ms. Negrón and Mr. Reynolds sponsored Resolution No. 2019-014 to confirm the reappointment.

Voting AYE: Ms. Negrón, Mr. Reynolds, Dr. Van Wirt, Mr. Callahan, Mr. Colón, Mr. Martell, and Mr. Waldron, 7. The Resolution passed.

9. *Administrative Order – Charles Harris – Sister City Commission*

Eric Evans, Business Administrator, read Mayor Donchez' reappointment of Charles Harris to membership on the Sister City Commission effective through December, 2021. Mr. Reynolds and Dr. Van Wirt sponsored Resolution No. 2019-015 to confirm the reappointment.

Voting AYE: Ms. Negrón, Mr. Reynolds, Dr. Van Wirt, Mr. Callahan, Mr. Colón, Mr. Martell, and Mr. Waldron, 7. The Resolution passed.

10. *Administrative Order – Terry Novatnack – Zoning Hearing Board*

Eric Evans, Business Administrator, read Mayor Donchez' reappointment of Terry Novatnack to membership on the Bethlehem Zoning Hearing Board effective through January, 2024. Mr. Reynolds and Dr. Van Wirt sponsored Resolution No. 2019-016 to confirm the reappointment.

Dr. Van Wirt mentioned her comments have nothing to do with Mr. Novatnack; it is about how Council relates to appointments and what the power of Council is in terms of these appointments. She remarked there were two powers that Council was given back in the 1950's when the Commission established this strong Mayor form of government. One of them was the budget and the other one was approval of Mayoral appointments. She feels that Council's relationships with some of these Boards and Authorities is less than ideal and to help foster that relationship she talked to President Waldron today and asked that the Mayor include resumes and contact information for the people who they are nominating. She added that she contacted Ms. Cunningham and it was a way for them to hear what they may not hear by talking to us regularly. They had a very productive and good conversation. Dr. Van Wirt hopes we can have this type of relationship with the people who are volunteers coming in with good interest to serve the City so we can have a good relationship and clear up some of the communication lines so we can get the work of the City done better. She looks forward to receiving that information from the Mayor on the next appointments.

President Waldron explained it has been the practice of the Administration to include those at times, but if we are all on the same page that is a good thing to have more information moving forward. If individual Members of Council want to reach out with any questions or just to chat that is a positive step.

Mr. Evans added that the Mayor always welcomes that and he agrees. There was a concern of Councilman Reynolds years ago with a Planning Commission Member. We had situation similar with the BRIA and it came out up front. We would much rather if Council Members have any questions at any time to reach out to the Mayor or to the applicant themselves. We want more people to get engaged in local government and he loves the fact that we have so many. Mr. Evans informed they are working on updating the website and it is amazing to see the number of Boards and Commissions and the number of volunteers required to run all of those. He pointed out other than the Zoning Hearing Board, which Members receive a nominal fee; all of these do not get paid. The volunteers give up their time and some of these Boards have long meetings. We know they are qualified and have good reputations around the City and that is why the Mayor puts them out there. If Council has any questions about them individually or potential conflicts of interest or other concerns we welcome hearing that.

Voting AYE: Ms. Negrón, Mr. Reynolds, Dr. Van Wirt, Mr. Callahan, Mr. Colón, Mr. Martell, and Mr. Waldron, 7. The Resolution passed.

City Properties for Sale

Mr. Evans stated on October 12, 2018 there was a Committee of the Whole Meeting and at that time they reviewed 12 properties and a package was presented to Council that included a spreadsheet with data on those properties. He remarked there were site visits and Council was encouraged to take a look the properties between October 12th and now if they had any particular questions. He added, prior to the Committee of the Whole Meeting they met with the Director of Public Works, Recreation, Grounds Department and our Planning Bureau to look at these 12 properties to see if there were any concerns. We did not have any at that time. At this time he is asking if there are any properties that Council would want to disqualify before we do the additional work. Mr. Evans stated that Assistant Solicitor Ed Healy's thought was to package the ones that would have a similar process to bring those properties to sale, just for efficiencies. Before they move forward he queried if there are any properties that Council would like to speak to tonight, put on hold or disqualify this evening.

President Waldron noted the Committee of the Whole Meeting was pretty extensive and we had a good dialogue about all of those properties. He stated some properties seemed somewhat obvious that the City should have never had those, but others parcels would be clearly more challenging to sell. President Waldron informed his personal opinion is that he thought it would be a positive move, for different reasons, to try to sell some of the properties or in some cases to gift to people, depending on the specifics. At that time during that meeting we did not have all of the Members of Council so they were not privy to that but we did get that information in a packet, so it is available to us. President Waldron does not think anyone brought up any objections to any specific properties at that time, but will open this up to his colleagues to see if they give you their blessing.

Mr. Evans noted this is ongoing and if anything comes up a few months from now to let them know and they will stop. He assured they will not be processing all 12 properties at the same time. They will choose, working with the Legal Bureau, which ones we want to work on first. Mr. Evans communicated that they did receive a couple phone calls on the property on Third and Broadhead from two different property owners. He added that Councilwoman Van Wirt noted this as a particular property of interest because of the location. Mr. Evans added

regarding Pulaski Park, they received a call from a group that would like to host the statue and memorial on their church site. He asserted if there is any sensitivity such as that they will share that with Council. Mr. Evans acknowledged when the time comes to sell the properties it will require a formal vote of Council, no matter what property. Some may require a zoning change as part of that to prepare for a parcel for sale, so that would be a vote and then another vote at a different time.

President Waldron asked if there are any thoughts or questions from Council.

Mr. Callahan mentioned he was not at that meeting but queried about the large property along Route 378. He pointed out some of those neighbors have taken care of that property as their own backyard even though they do not own it. He wondered if there is a possibility that we would offer it to them at whatever the appraised value is before it goes out on the market. He knows there is not a good access point to that property.

Mr. Evans stated that is a very small access point; the better access point is off of Kelchner Road. It is a large property, almost four acres with very little access to it. He advised there is not much of an opportunity for that land to be developed. It would have to be someone who could be creative to do something with that. When we visited that site this summer it is mostly all overgrown; it is up against Route 378. Mr. Evans believes there are limitations to selling something directly without going to auction and making it available to everybody.

Mr. Callahan stated his concern is that someone goes in there and buys it for a substantial amount of money and puts a unit in there, essentially in the people's backyards.

Mr. Evans noted there are limits on that property that access would not allow. The access width is enough for a driveway so you could buy it and put a house back there, but you could not put anything more than that because you would need lights, thus there could not be anything like an apartment complex or multi-housing.

Dr. Van Wirt stated she was at that meeting but does not remember the zoning change aspect to the sale of these properties. She was wondering if the Administration could provide Council a list of which properties would entail a zoning change and what that zoning change would be, before they have to weigh in finally.

Mr. Evans informed most of them were blue on the grid and blue represents Institutional. City owned property is Institutional. There are three or four those properties that would need to be changed from Institutional to Residential because they are surrounded by residences. Mr. Evans mentioned Ullman Park, going up Wyandotte Hill. That picture is where the cemetery slopes down; it is another difficult property and he does not know if there is value to that or not. We thought the best use would be a continued use by the cemetery because of access points, and that is why some of these properties sit with us.

President Waldron commented we will look forward to the continued communications with Mr. Evans on this subject.

Mr. Evans stressed this will be a slow moving process and will keep Council abreast of changes. As we bring them forward you will know what they are before you need to vote so that will be a long and more detailed conversation as the year progresses.

8. ORDINANCES FOR FINAL PASSAGE

None.

9. NEW ORDINANCES

None.

10. RESOLUTIONS

A. *Approving Support Resolution – Fair Funding Formula for Pennsylvania Schools*

Mr. Reynolds and Ms. Negrón sponsored Resolution No. 2019-017 that encourages the State House and Senate to pass legislation in support of the full implementation of the Fair Funding Formula by rerouting all or substantially more State basic education dollars through the formula. The disparate effects of the “hold harmless” provision of State funding to school districts should be addressed, because the practice perpetuates historic funding inequities between wealthier and poorer school districts.

Mr. Reynolds stated he first became aware of this issue through a few things, his full time job as a teacher at Allen High School and he sees these inequities every day. In Bethlehem it has come to the forefront from people like Dr. Roy, Mr. Faccinetto, Ms. Beck-Pooley, Ms. Gallagher and people that have talked about this issue. One of the things that he loves about our public education advocates who speak out is that they are very proud of what their child does or why they are involved in the school and that is not all that they care about. It is about the community and about those classrooms. Mr. Reynolds knows that everybody here spends a substantial amount of time in schools and it is hard when you walk into a classroom or into a school not to almost instantly start caring about everybody’s situation and think, it is not just my kid, it is what we can do here. One thing that Mr. Faccinetto did not talk about is that this \$23 million dollars and this formula did not come from some super liberal advocacy group. Rather, it came from a bi-partisan commission in Harrisburg that took into account school poverty, current level of district taxation, the number of English language learners and the financial impact of Charter Schools. These numbers are not democratic numbers, they are not urban numbers; they were numbers that just reflected this particular situation. Mr. Reynolds credits the advocates for our public schools, and noted that a lot of the issues that face our children and students are the same issue we see on a different level. He has learned in attending the Northside 2027 meetings that a lot of the issues we deal with are the same issues being dealt with in the schools. Public education is supposed to be the great equalizer and Mr. Faccinetto reminded him that the old Liberty Principal Bill Burkhardt’s famous line was “Bethlehem goes as Liberty goes and Liberty goes as Bethlehem goes.” It is certainly true. Mr. Reynolds mentioned he spoke with Lisa Boscola’s office and Representative Samuelson’s office, and they are aware of this. They have sponsored the Bills, they are working towards this. Mr. Reynolds thinks there is a little more optimism than not that this will pick up some momentum, because not only was the Governor just re-elected, but we also have a larger number of public education advocates in Harrisburg that have just been sworn in, which is more than we have had in a while. This School District and the

City are tied to each other and we have an unbelievable amount of advocates. He knows when he talks to the parents in his neighborhood he sees a great amount of pride, and sometimes anger about some issues, but the passion and what the school district means to people is important. He pointed out most of the issues facing the School District and the City going forward are going to be tied to each other. He feels it is our job to be the advocates for these issues facing the Bethlehem Area School District. Mr. Reynolds informed when he talks to the School Board Members and parents, they are aware about issues facing the City as well. He has had conversations with Dr. Roy and the Mayor about things like the digital divide. He pointed out we can have the greatest teachers in the world and kids can go to school every day, but if they do not have an opportunity to get onto the internet at home they will fall behind. That is the type of issue that the City should be partnering with the school district going forward, and Mr. Reynolds knows that Mayor Donchez' Administration is certainly aware of that. This Resolution is just one small statement about our priorities. Ideally, he wishes that City Hall was right next to the Administration Building so we could work even closer. He asserted the School District is the one other institution that covers a lot of these same issues we do. Mr. Reynolds informed we have a communications survey that we are looking to launch in the next few months. We have open data, technology, apps and all of these types of things that will help our citizens have access to things they may not currently have or make it easier for them to have that access. Mr. Reynolds communicated we need to support the PTA and the school district. If they have a budget issue one year, it is our issue and our problem, just like our issues and our problems are the School Districts too. He would encourage Council going forward to be aware of this particular issue and continue to be advocates for our School District, parents, families who look to us to help level the playing field to keep that promise that public education is the great equalizer. He knows that has helped out a lot of people in this room; many are teachers and proud advocates for our school district.

Mr. Callahan completely agrees with Mr. Reynolds. As a Nitschmann Lion and a Liberty Hurricane, he is very proud of coming up through the Bethlehem Area School District. He thanked all of the spokespeople at the meeting tonight. He expressed the School District has done a great job in the last 15 years of taking a lot of our taxpayer resources and putting it to good use in rebuilding our schools. He expressed if you look around at the schools we are set up for the next 20 years. This was done at a great time when our bond rates were well and the borrowing rate was favorable. Mr. Callahan noted he has been an educator at Freedom High School and now at Northeast Middle School. He informed the School District has also spent a lot of money in technology; the students at Northeast Middle School all have Chrome Books. The population at Northeast Middle School is very diverse and remarked that it is a joy every day to go in school and see the kids working very hard. He is proud to say he is a Bethlehem Area School District graduate and employee. Mr. Callahan acknowledged State Senator Lisa Boscola who has a very similar Bill as what we are looking to support here tonight. Senator Boscola introduced Bill 1272 in the last Senate session and it was introduced this session but it does not yet have a bill number. He wondered if it would be the will or want of Council to support the Senator's Bill or if Council can add an amendment to this Resolution stating that, "Whereas we also support State Senator Lisa Boscola's efforts in trying to pass her Fair Funding Formula." Mr. Callahan does want to acknowledge that she has been working on this for over a year and a half now. He believes Senator Boscola also sent a copy of this to Dr. Roy.

President Waldron thinks that is exactly what we are doing this evening with this Resolution to show that we support those efforts. He does not know if there is a way we can tie to this formally or if that is necessary.

Mr. Reynolds informed this does not matter to him. He knows that Senator Boscola and Representative Samuelson, both the House and the Senate, have advocated at the last session and this is in no means having to do with their work. He has spoken with both of their offices about this issue. Mr. Reynolds added that this is about showing the School District that we understand their situation and this is another step in bringing us together in working on problems.

Mr. Callahan then made the motion for an amendment. "Be it further resolved that the City of Bethlehem supports the efforts of State Senator Lisa Boscola's Senate Bill 1272 on Fair Funding Formula for Pennsylvania School and encourages the State to pass this expeditiously."

President Waldron seconded the motion.

Voting AYE on the Amendment to Resolution 10 A: Ms. Negrón, Mr. Reynolds, Dr. Van Wirt, Mr. Callahan, Mr. Colón, Mr. Martell, and Mr. Waldron, 7. The Resolution passed.

Voting AYE on the Resolution as Amended: Ms. Negrón, Mr. Reynolds, Dr. Van Wirt, Mr. Callahan, Mr. Colón, Mr. Martell, and Mr. Waldron, 7. The Resolution passed.

Motion – considering Resolutions 10 B through 10 J as a group

Mr. Colón and Dr. Van Wirt moved to consider Resolutions 10 B through 10 J as a group.

Voting AYE: Ms. Negrón, Mr. Reynolds, Dr. Van Wirt, Mr. Callahan, Mr. Colón, Mr. Martell, and Mr. Waldron, 7. The Motion passed.

B. Authorizing Contract – Material Matters, Inc.

Ms. Negrón and Mr. Reynolds sponsored Resolution No. 2019-018 that authorized to execute an agreement with Material Matters, Inc. for Bio-solids Beneficial Use Program Consulting Services.

C. Authorizing Contract – S. C. Engineers, Inc.

Ms. Negrón and Mr. Reynolds sponsored Resolution No. 2019-019 that authorized to execute an agreement with S. C. Engineers, Inc. for the 2019 Annual Consulting Services for the Industrial Pretreatment Program and Miscellaneous Assignments.

D. Authorizing Contract – Van Cleef Engineering Associates, LLC

Ms. Negrón and Mr. Reynolds sponsored Resolution No. 2019-020 that authorized to execute an agreement with Van Cleef Engineering Associates, LLC for the Evaluation, Design and Construction Management for Replacement of Wild Creek Intake Tower Link Elements.

E. Authorizing Contract – Keystone Engineering Group, Inc.

Ms. Negrón and Mr. Reynolds sponsored Resolution No. 2019-021 that authorized to execute an agreement with Keystone Engineering Group, Inc. for the Wastewater Treatment Plant Effluent Pump Station Electrical Controls Upgrade.

F. Authorizing Contract – Steven G. Lowry & Associates, Inc.

Ms. Negrón and Mr. Reynolds sponsored Resolution No. 2019-022 that authorized to execute an agreement with Steven G. Lowry & Associates, Inc. for the 2019 Annual Engineering Services for Department of Water & Sewer Resources Water Engineering.

G. Authorizing Contract – Gannett Fleming Valuation and Rate Consultants, LLC – Customer Class Demand Study

Ms. Negrón and Mr. Reynolds sponsored Resolution No. 2019-023 that authorized to execute an agreement with Gannett Fleming Valuation and Rate Consultants, LLC to Conduct the Customer Class Demand Study.

H. Authorizing Contract – Emerson Process Management Power & Water Solutions, Inc.

Ms. Negrón and Mr. Reynolds sponsored Resolution No. 2019-024 that authorized to execute an agreement with Emerson Process Management Power & Water Solutions, Inc. for the 2019 Licensed Software Support for SCADA System at Water Treatment Plant, Water Distribution Control, and Wastewater Treatment Plant.

I. Authorizing Contract – Gannett Fleming Valuation and Rate Consultants, LLC

Ms. Negrón and Mr. Reynolds sponsored Resolution No. 2019-025 that authorized to execute an agreement with Gannett Fleming Valuation and Rate Consultants, LLC for Update of Capital Value and Depreciation of the City's Water System.

J. Authorizing Contract – Triad Associates

Ms. Negrón and Mr. Reynolds sponsored Resolution No. 2019-026 that authorized to execute an agreement with Triad Associates for Community Development Consulting.

Voting AYE on Resolutions 10 B through 10 J: Ms. Negrón, Mr. Reynolds, Dr. Van Wirt, Mr. Callahan, Mr. Colón, Mr. Martell, and Mr. Waldron, 7. The Resolutions passed.

K. Authorizing Cash Balance Transfer – 9-1-1 Funds – Non-Utility Capital Fund

Ms. Negrón and Mr. Reynolds sponsored Resolution No. 2019-027 that authorized approval for the transfer of \$2,075,000 by the City Administration from the 9-1-1 Fund to the Non-Utility Capital Fund for various capital projects as approved by City Council as part of the budget process.

Voting AYE: Ms. Negrón, Mr. Reynolds, Dr. Van Wirt, Mr. Callahan, Mr. Colón, Mr. Martell, and Mr. Waldron, 7. The Resolution passed.

L. Authorizing Cash Balance Transfer – Excess Gaming Funds – Non-Utility Capital Fund

Ms. Negrón and Mr. Reynolds sponsored Resolution No. 2019-028 that authorized approval for the transfer of \$2,468,000 in excess gaming funds by the City Administration from the General Fund to the Non-Utility Capital Fund for various capital projects as approved by City Council as part of the budget process.

Voting AYE: Ms. Negrón, Mr. Reynolds, Dr. Van Wirt, Mr. Callahan, Mr. Colón, Mr. Martell, and Mr. Waldron, 7. The Resolution passed.

M. Authorizing Contract – David Weiner Design

Ms. Negrón and Mr. Reynolds sponsored Resolution No. 2019-029 that authorized to execute an agreement with David Weiner Design for the Christmas Lighting/Décor Design Project.

Voting AYE: Ms. Negrón, Mr. Reynolds, Dr. Van Wirt, Mr. Callahan, Mr. Colón, Mr. Martell, and Mr. Waldron, 7. The Resolution passed.

11. NEW BUSINESS

Public Safety Committee Meeting

Chairman Colón announced a Public Safety Committee Meeting will be held on Tuesday, January 22, 2019 at 6:00 pm. The subject will be the 9-1-1 Agreements with Northampton County.

Southside Arts District Annual Meeting

Mr. Colón mentioned that he, Councilman Reynolds and Ms. Karner had a chance to go to the annual meeting for the Southside Arts District. He noted that Missy Hartney, who runs the Southside Arts District, was aware that we had a City Council Meeting tonight and would forward to us the information they presented. Mr. Colón expressed many people there were from the non-profit community, education, small business owners and others. He expects Council Members will be receiving that information from Ms. Hartney in the days to come.

Mr. Reynolds remarked in talking with the people who were at that meeting, whether they were business owners or citizens, he could see not only that people are excited about many things that the Arts District is currently doing, but they do care. When you walk out of meetings like that it is just a reminder about how many people in the City care. We also have many citizens and business owners who are very excited and engaged going forward. He does want to give the Administration credit for supporting the Southside Arts District. Mr. Reynolds noted it was a packed room at this meeting and it was impressive.

Mr. Callahan added that is just an example of all of the good things that are going on in the south side. He is sure that many saw the reports today that Wind Creek is going to be investing up to \$190 million dollars in new projects over at the south side. There is a possibility of a brand new hotel and also a water park at the Number Two Machine Shop, which has been

sitting there for a long time. That is a critical piece to the redevelopment at this site. This will make the south side better and better.

Oversight of Boards and Commissions

Dr. Van Wirt referenced the Bethlehem Redevelopment Authority minutes from their November meeting and was concerned about a few paragraphs on the next to last page regarding the October F.A.I.R. hearing, which she thinks was a fundamentally useful and transparent thing to do. She read the paragraphs:

“Mr. Hanna indicated that on October 29, 2018 he and Ms. Bambu-Weiss attended the FAIR hearing before the Community Development Committee of Bethlehem City Council. He noted that the RDA was present at this hearing due to funding provided as part of the Greenway Commons project, located within the designated TIF District. He added that other programs which provide economic development benefits to the City were also discussed and presented at this hearing, such as the CRIZ and LERTA.”

“Mr. Hanna indicated the Board may have seen some publicity recently as a result of this hearing presentation. He stated that both he and the Mayor have taken steps to assure everyone that all funds have been used in acceptable ways for eligible projects and that all projects and needs for the community are being considered and addressed. Mr. Hanna noted that the RDA Bond Counsel is finalizing a communication regarding the funding provided to the Greenway Commons project for site remediation as an eligible use of TIF funds per state law. Mr. Hanna also noted that the Mayor has clarified the discussions about a parking garage in the vicinity of Polk Street is an issue which has been discussed for approximately 10-years. Mr. Hanna indicated that he will continue to keep the Board updated on this and any other matters which may arise as a result of this presentation.”

Dr. Van Wirt just wanted to clarify because these are going down in public minutes. She informed that she has not been assured at all, and just because someone did something that is legal it does not make it ethical, moral or a reasonable use of the citizen's tax dollars. Dr. Van Wirt added that she does not feel that the Mayor has clarified the discussion about the parking garage; we have just merely delayed that discussion. She informed she is bringing this up because she does not want it to go down unchecked in the public record. She remarked that Council has not yet received an adequate explanation of why this \$800,000 dollar grant to the developer was made instead of investment into what the public would benefit from. Dr. Van Wirt stated she is deeply troubled by the lack of oversight of our Boards and Commissions. She is optimistic we will have better communications with Council as a result of the BRIA appointment and as CRIZ projects move forward. She remarked she is eager to see new leadership as our Bethlehem CRIZ projects have brought in approximately on tenth of what Lancaster's CRIZ projects have brought in. Dr. Van Wirt is concerned with lack of oversight at the Parking Authority with no clear business plan in place. She noted the Parking Authority's short term borrowing for maintenance of the garages and feels this is something that should be outlined and planned for in a responsible business plan. Dr. Van Wirt asserted BRIA, Bethlehem Redevelopment Authority, and the Parking Authority were created to work for Bethlehem citizens to build our tax base, to serve our parking needs and to minister our TIF among other things. Dr. Van Wirt thinks they have been exceptionally poor performing and wants Council to understand that Bethlehem deserves better. She remarked that we need a CRIZ that works to

rebuild our downtowns, a Parking Authority that can float its own debt and work to serve the citizens, and a Redevelopment Authority that understands that TIF money came out of our school children's budget. She noted it matters what you do with that money. The Redevelopment Authority minutes, the CRIZ performance and the Parking Authority transparency is why she will keep talking about it.

President Waldron pointed out that the BRIA appointment this evening was not for the Chair position and added that is voted on by the Members of that Board.

Mr. Callahan queried if Councilwoman Van Wirt had a chance to talk to Mr. Hanna at all.

Dr. Van Wirt replied yes.

Mr. Callahan asked if he explained the whole process and how it works.

Dr. Van Wirt stated yes.

Mr. Callahan wondered if she knew there are only two entities that were even eligible for that RDA money.

Dr. Van Wirt noted this is not the appropriate time for us to discuss this.

President Waldron explained comments should be addressed to the Chair as well as this may not be a conversation to have now.

Mr. Callahan pointed out he did not bring this up but he does have a right to speak.

President Waldron noted he does but under Roberts Rules comments should be addressed to the Chair.

Mr. Callahan suggested Dr. Van Wirt do more research because he feels there are more facts involved than what was stated.

Mr. Reynolds noted to bring that together he had the opportunity to talk to Mr. Hanna and others. He mentioned that part of his initial frustration was information that was not shared at the particular F.A.I.R. hearing. He met with Mr. Hanna afterwards and found out a lot of information. Mr. Reynolds was disappointed that he did not provide more information at the particular F.A.I.R. hearing when it came up and that it required a conversation afterwards. He would say that was the genesis for his disappointment. He continued to say the one thing that brings both comments together between Dr. Van Wirt and Mr. Callahan is the fact that it seems that the most germane time that part of this conversation will happen again is when we have the future Polk Street Garage financing conversation. He related that would be an opportunity for the Administration, the Mayor and Ms. Karner and whoever it may be, to say this is the timeline and when decisions were made and be clear about it. Mr. Reynolds thinks the ambiguity in explaining a timeline with when decisions were made and who they were made by has led to confusion and that needs to be explained. He does not think they were explained clearly and publicly, and that is part of the comments made by Dr. Van Wirt and Mr. Callahan. The good news is there is an opportunity for that to happen. Mr. Reynolds had questions following that in

November and December where he said he did not think that was the time to ask those questions, since we were tabling the fine increase. He thinks the time to ask those questions has to do with the presentation by the Administration whenever that Polk Street financing or ticket increase will come forward. Mr. Reynolds noted he called Mr. Hanna and as Dr. Van Wirt stated she did, but it should not have been where we had that meeting where there was no information, then there was a newspaper article and then they had a conversation. Mr. Reynolds explained we have the opportunity going forward to get everything in order so we are able to have a public presentation of the timeline, decisions that were made and why and how they were made. That was one of the advantages of tabling the parking fine increases. It allows whatever needs to happen as far as lining up that type of public conversation. Mr. Reynolds believes that public conversation is necessary.

Recreation Director Jane Persa Retirement

President Waldron informed that City Council was notified that one of our dear employees, Jane Persa, is going to be retiring this year after 40 years of serving the City's Parks and Recreation Department in a few different positions and now is Director of the Recreation Bureau. He acknowledged her commitment to the City and thanked her for her time. Everyone applauded Ms. Persa and Council wished her well.

12. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 8:30 p.m.

ATTEST:

City Clerk