

BETHLEHEM CITY COUNCIL MEETING
10 East Church Street - Town Hall
Bethlehem, Pennsylvania
Wednesday, January 2, 2019 - 7:00 PM

INVOCATION

Rabbi Michael Singer, Congregation Brith Sholom, offered the Invocation which was followed by the pledge to the flag.

PLEDGE TO THE FLAG

1. ROLL CALL

President Waldron called the meeting to order. Present were Bryan G. Callahan, Michael G. Colón, Shawn M. Martell, Olga Negrón, J. William Reynolds, Paige Van Wirt, and Adam R. Waldron, 7.

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

None.

3. PUBLIC COMMENT (on any subject not being voted on this evening - 5 minutes time limit)

H2O Hookah Lounge Incidences

Tyler Buck, 19 East Third Street, explained he is at this meeting to speak about the H2O Hookah Lounge for the second time within a year. He spoke last spring and since then he can say they are extremely grateful for the increase police presence around H2O. Unfortunately, the additional enforcement has not reversed the trajectory of serious and violent incidences at this location. He noted an altercation in between two H2O patrons, and an employee being stabbed by a patron on August 28th, and a shooting involving a patron on December 26th. He noted in addition to injury to an individual, several shots occurred and vehicles and a business were also hit, and that shot was also fired about 10 feet shy of his own personal residence. He pointed out that Domino's and the Tó Makao Cigar Shop are losing business because the behavior of H2O patrons. Other businesses in the area are also being impacted by this developing reputation for violent crime. He asserted we do not want Lehigh, for example to develop a reputation for campus safety. Mr. Buck informed this problem does not have to be endemic to this type of establishment. Essence Hookah Lounge is nearly one block away, which has nearly identical clientele, business model and operating hours, but does not share any of the same issues. Mr. Buck related there are opportunities for intervention. He continued on to say there are actionable transgressions that are consistently overlooked by police in the area such as patrons carry open containers of alcohol through the parking lot across the street and on the public sidewalk. He referenced minors being admitted too. Mr. Buck informed that in December of this past year he found out from a dispatcher that the vast majority of calls they made were not registered as noise complaints because they needed to speak face to face with the police officer. That is something

that was not indicated to us by any party previous to that time. Mr. Buck urges Council to take additional action before this becomes a place of year round violent crime. He stressed that he, his roommates and neighbors live and work in this community and love watching it grow and develop. The south side is a vibrant cultural center and an important part of our City. He expressed this issue is undermining all of the investment in this region. He urged Council to join in the effort to protect the visitors, residents, and local businesses from the escalating violence which surrounds the issue of the H2O lounge and its patrons.

President Waldron appreciates the comments by Mr. Buck in following up with Council on this issue. He added Chief DiLuzio is at this meeting and can speak to Mr. Buck as well.

Mayor Donchez remarked they discussed this problem at a staff meeting this morning. He added that they are looking at zoning ordinances, the noise ordinance, also a variety of things for enforcement because this is a problem.

Chief DiLuzio explained when bars close at 2:00 am, the BYOB clubs or after hour clubs continue to operate because they do not come under control of the Liquor Control Enforcement. They do not have a liquor license. With a liquor license you have to close at 2:00 am. We do have an ordinance in the City in reference to them and we will be working with permits, licensing and zoning in reference to that. In the crimes code there is Section 6504, Public Nuisance, and he will check with the District Attorney's office on how we can apply that to a business. It is usually used for different types of situations. Our problem here is when the bars close all over the Valley this is one of the few places that are left open so you get the people who come to these establishments, and they do not close until 4:00 am or 5:00 am. Chief DiLuzio added people bring their own alcohol, they just pay for glasses and ice inside. The establishments are not legitimately selling alcohol so they are immune from many of the Liquor Control Board enforcement regulations. We did check with the Liquor Control Board enforcement on these and this is a gray area of the State Liquor law. He remarked it is something that needs to be addressed at the State level with Liquid Control Enforcement. Chief DiLuzio pointed out this weekend you will see a bigger presence of police there at the bars. Everyone involved in the shooting were not from Bethlehem; they were from Allentown.

President Waldron thanked Chief DiLuzio and added this is a circumstance where there is perpetual violation of common decency in the neighborhood. If it requires a change in the ordinance he is sure that City Council can get behind and support.

Chief DiLuzio confirmed that is what they are reviewing right now. He explained that BYOB ordinance was adopted by Council in 1999, so we may have to update it to make it enforceable under 2019 rules.

President Waldron encouraged Chief DiLuzio to touch base with Mr. Buck this evening to have an action plan moving forward so that there are no miscommunications.

HCC Procedures/Council Decorum/Bethlehem Moment

Ed Gallagher, 49 West Greenwich Street, mentioned he would like to suggest something from him and other people that might bring some closure to the 306 South New Street portion of the meeting. A mistake happened there on part of the City and the representative of the City did

not duck the issue, they accepted responsibility. Mr. Colón had asked if there would be a review of procedures so that this kind of thing would not happen again and that representative agreed that would happen. Mr. Gallagher noted Council was put in a tough position and several said they did not want to be put in that position again. He is wondering if Council would request from the City a report of a review of those procedures so you are sure that a procedure has been put into place. Mr. Gallagher continued on to say that President Waldron should review decorum with Council. He related we have had a few things in the past few meetings where decorum was breached with Council Members addressing each other and even looking to talk to people in the audience. He thinks Council needs to be refreshed on those aspects of Roberts Rules. Mr. Gallagher then presented his Bethlehem Moment noting he went back and looked for the original zoning ordinance. He referenced the date of February 24, 1926 when it was adopted. He noted two years went into studying Bethlehem's first zoning ordinance whose purpose, in the exact same words of our zoning ordinance today, is to preserve the health, safety and general welfare of the community. He noted the ordinance was ready to go on November, 1925 but the real estate board succeeded in getting it delayed until the next Council took office. He referenced phrases from various articles noting the ordinance is so lengthy, complicated, and obscure it is utterly impossible for even the most intelligent man to digest, they said. The real estate board generated a large crowd that turned out for an informational meeting. They claimed that 98% of the businessmen on the west side were opposed to zoning. On February 15th, the day of the First Reading a petition to abandon the ordinance signed by 114 residents was delivered to City Council. On February 24th, the day of the Second Reading the board presented a 10 point manifesto climaxing in the claim that the Board of Appeals was open to favoritism and discrimination, but the ordinance prevailed.

Ordinances

Stephen Antalics, 737 Ridge Street, referred to Council's approval of the property on 4th and Vine Streets, the building at 306 South New Street and New Street Garage and expressed all violated Article 1714 - Historic Conservation District and Mount Airy. He questioned whether ordinances are designed to protect the welfare of the community versus developers. The top floor of the 306 South New Street building represented confusion but the resolution of the confusion gave the developer what they needed in violation of the resolution. Mr. Antalics informed that he received a flyer to attend a meeting at 306 South New Street and the topic was the renewed preservation of South New Street. In attendance were primarily young students unaware of these previous discrepancies and being told something, which to him, was pie in the sky. Mr. Antalics referenced the 5-2 vote against the HCC Certificate of Approval denial and the 5-2 approval for a Certificate of Approval for ZEST and reflected there seems to be evolving this 5-2 vote that he alluded to in a previous meeting. Mr. Antalics explained the Ordinance for 2 West Market was a 4-3 vote, because one member of Council decided to side with the 5-2 people. He expressed as he said before, as nature proved his point, at least in his thinking, that those two voters are caretakers, and maybe someone on Council saw the light.

President Waldron thanked Mr. Antalics but wanted to clarify a few points. He pointed out that there is no ordinance on height in the south side, those are HCC guidelines and all of the recommendations have come from the HCC who are the experts on historic preservation. We passed them, but the HCC are the ones who set those guidelines, not Council.

Mr. Antalics informed he disagrees and remarked he should have the freedom to address because Mr. Waldron is calling him wrong.

President Waldron informed Mr. Antalics he had his 5 minutes to speak.

Mr. Antalics reiterated that President Waldron made a comment about him without his ability to respond so he wants to speak again and noted that this should be fair. He noted that Ordinance 1714 is an ordinance that says no buildings in that area of the historic district should be more than four or five stories high. The three buildings are higher than that.

President Waldron noted those were HCC recommendations that Council followed.

4. PUBLIC COMMENT (on ordinances and resolutions to be voted on by Council this evening - 5 Minute Time Limit)

None.

5. OLD BUSINESS

- A. Members of Council
- B. Tabled Items
- C. Unfinished Business

6. COMMUNICATIONS

A. *Human Resources Director - Recommendation of Award - Preferred EAP*

The Clerk read a memorandum dated December 19, 2018 from Michelle Cichocki, Human Resources Director recommending a contract with Preferred EAP for Employee Assistance Services. The term of the contract is January 1, 2019 through December 31, 2019 and the fee for the contract is \$14,300 a year.

President Waldron stated 10 B is on the agenda.

B. *9-1-1 Director/Emergency Management Coordinator - Emergency Operations Plan - Updating City Officials*

The Clerk read a memorandum dated January 1, 2019 from Robert Novatnack, 9-1-1 Director/Emergency Management Coordinator to which is attached a proposed Resolution to authorize the Mayor to adopt the City of Bethlehem Emergency Operations Plan dated January 1, 2019, which has been developed to outline basic operations and procedures to be implemented in the event of an incident either man-made or natural that requires a coordinated response.

President Waldron stated Resolution 10 C is on the agenda.

7. REPORTS

A. *President of Council*

President Waldron informed he would like to take this moment to thank our Information Services Bureau, particularly Jonathan Palsi, for the assistance in coordinating the logistics for City Council Meetings to be recorded, beginning with this evening's meeting. The recordings will be available on YouTube and the City's website site the day after the meetings. To view the videos on the City's website site at www.bethlehem-pa.gov go to Quick Links and click on City Council Meeting Agendas and Documents and click on Video. He pointed out we intend to have a trial period of a few meetings to know how this new system is working with the camera that was mounted in Town Hall. There is a new logistical complication of an added step here with the computer for the Clerk, so we wanted to get a feel for that before we went live. After a few meetings he wanted to talk to Members of Council and our Information Services Bureau to receive feedback on how that was working before we made the commitment to go live. This will be just to make sure that everything was in line before we made that decision. President Waldron noted currently these are being recorded and the next day they will be posted online and then archived there moving forward.

1. *Annual Report*

President Waldron presented his Annual Report for 2018, as follows:

The year 2018 began with filling the vacancy on City Council that was created when former Council Member Eric R. Evans was selected by Mayor Donchez to serve as Business Administrator for the City, upon the retirement of David Brong. At a Special City Council Meeting on March 1, 2018, Council appointed Dr. Paige Van Wirt to fill the vacant City Council seat until January 2020.

During the last year I have had the honor of serving as President of City Council and then mentioned the following that was achieved by Council:

- City Council implemented concepts established in 2017 such as establishing Article 349 - Economic Development Reporting and Evaluation, Creating the Financial Accountability Incentive Reporting (F.A.I.R.) Program. The first F.A.I.R. hearing occurred in October and the respective hearing reports have been posted on the City website.
- In coordination with the Mayor, three Working Groups comprised of City representatives, interested citizens, and community stakeholders, met to address climate action planning, municipal social media and communications, and development of a City open data program.
- Members of Council met with the Pennsylvania State Ethics Commission at a Committee of the Whole Meeting to receive Ethics Training required by Article 104. Members of the Administration joined Council Members at the training session in Town Hall.
- In 2018 Information Services made the audio recordings of City Council Meetings available on the City's website. City Council also expressed an interest in video recording the City Council Meetings and posting recordings for the public to view

at their convenience. Video recording will commence at the first meeting in January 2019 as they have this evening.

- City Council authorized the sale of Redevelopment Authority property and rezoned the respective parcels bordered by Conestoga Street, PA Route 378 and 143 West Broad Street in connection with the proposed Skyline West development of luxury apartments.
- Also included among legislation passed by City Council in 2018 were Ordinances to establish three new Articles in the City of Bethlehem that include Article 744-Marijuana Possession; Article 746-Consumer Fireworks; Article 1122-Appropriate Mental Health Services and Appeals Board.
- Council authorized the City to transfer to ArtsQuest the initial and subsequent gross terminal revenue distribution of \$250,000 annually from the Local Share Assessment within the State Treasury, Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, for which purposes are for funding the redevelopment of an existing arts and education center that has a professional artist space and studios and is located within the city of the third class that is located in two counties of the third class.
- The Members of Council approved several changes to the City's Zoning Ordinance. Ordinances were adopted to amend First Floor uses in the CB and CL District, Maximum Building Coverage in the RT District, define the definition for a Hotel, define the definition of CRIZ and CRIZ lot requirements, amended the maximum percent building coverage in the CB District, and prohibit a Fast-Casual Restaurant with a drive through in the CB and CL Districts. In addition, Council adopted an Ordinance to amend Section 1304.04 of the zoning code to enable the conversion of a single family dwelling to an office use by special exception in certain limited circumstances in the RT and RG zoning districts.
- In the area of Parks and Recreation, City Council authorized an application for a PA DCNR grant in the amount of \$1,000,000 for the renovation of the Memorial Pool complex and the City was awarded the grant in October 2018, which was announced by DCNR Secretary Cindy Dunn during her visit to Bethlehem.
- Upon recommendation of the Finance Committee, an Ordinance was adopted to finance the capital improvements at the Municipal Golf Course, such as improving and extending the cart paths, paving the parking lots, bunker renovations, constructing a permanent pavilion, replacing the old barn on Illick's Mill Road that houses maintenance, to name a few. Further, following the recommendation from the Parks and Recreation Committee, City Council also authorized a new seven-year lease with the Clubhouse Grille for the restaurant facility.
- City Council conducted 21 Committee meetings, adopted 41 Ordinances and over 250 Resolutions.
- City Council amended the proposed 2019 Non-Utility Capital Budget, by reducing Street Overlays and eliminating the expense for an artificial 40 foot Christmas tree.

City Council voted to add \$100,000 for Rose Garden Improvements and \$40,000 for a Pedestrian Bridge Feasibility Study.

In closing, I would like to take this opportunity to thank my colleagues for their cooperation in 2018. I look forward to continue serving the Members of Council, the Administration, City employees, and the residents of the City of Bethlehem during 2019 as I enter the second year of my Council Presidency.

Robert's Rules of Order

President Waldron commented there have been some accusations regarding some of the rules with Robert's Rules of Order. He spoke to Council Solicitor Spirk about this and President Waldron went back and did some research on some of the things that were said by Members of Council and members of the public in the Council Minutes. He does not see a lot there as far as violations of Roberts Rules. He mentioned personal attacks is a term that has been thrown around for political reasons. He thinks there is a healthy debate and respect for each other on Council. We may not agree with each other and that is fine, and that sometimes comes down to the vote. He would like to think that we can move forward professionally, but there is decorum and he does not think that there has been a lack of professionalism from City Council. President Waldron noted there have been calls for him to gavel down other Members of Council when they are speaking but he does not see himself doing that in 2019. He thinks the First Amendment is strong and well in this room and he has great respect for it to the point where he respects it over Robert's Rules. President Waldron believes people should have the ability to speak their mind as long as they are doing it in a respectful way. He added disagreement is good because it shows different points of view and perspectives. He remarked you may not agree with that assessment and you might think we should follow Robert's Rules to the T. His view is that we should be able to have a positive conversation in which we respectfully disagree with each other that is not thrown to personal attacks just because we may use each other's names. That does not mean it is a personal attack, it is just a differing of opinion. President Waldron mentioned another point to the rules of Robert's Rules is that any Member of Council can talk about a subject on two separate occasions within a conversation, a third time would be at the leisure of the President of Council, which he will always allow, then a fourth time, if we are having a back and forth conversation, would be at the vote of Council. He has great respect for Robert's Rules but he thinks the First Amendment, as Mr. Spirk would agree in court rulings, is that the First Amendment will trump Robert's Rules any day of the week. If we want to point to Robert's Rules and say these are the rules that we are supposed to be following, he does respect those. However, he does think that a healthy dialogue starts with the ability to express yourself and if you do not like what someone else is saying he does not think censuring their speech is the right thing. He thinks that topping it with a better and more accurate speech or different point of view is a fine thing to do. President Waldron noted just like he and Mr. Antalics did this evening, we can respectfully disagree on a different point of view, but that is part of the process.

President Waldron added we can look forward to all of City Council Meetings being online and being on YouTube with a good resolution. He thanked all on Council for their work in 2018 and he looks forward to continuing relationships and the positive work we have done for the City in 2019.

B. *Mayor*

State of the City Speech

Mayor Donchez announced his State of the City speech will be given at ArtsQuest on March 7 at 7:30am, and Council will received an invitation. On another matter, the Administration will be sending to Council the memorandum of understanding from Northampton County dealing with 9-1-1 that will be on your agenda for the next Council Meeting. Council may want to refer that to Committee for discussion. We reached an agreement and that will be coming to you shortly. Mayor Donchez noted various elected officials have been doing Op-Ed pieces in the Morning Call, and that his will be in the Morning Call Newspaper tomorrow.

8. ORDINANCES FOR FINAL PASSAGE

None.

9. NEW ORDINANCES

None.

10. RESOLUTIONS

A. *Authorizing Records Destruction – Community and Economic Development Department*

Mr. Reynolds and Mr. Callahan sponsored Resolution No. 2019-001 that authorizes the disposition of the public records in the Community and Economic Development Department as stated in the attached Exhibit A.

Voting AYE: Mr. Martell, Ms. Negrón, Mr. Reynolds, Dr. Van Wirt, Mr. Callahan, Mr. Colón, and Mr. Waldron, 7. The Resolution passed.

B. *Authorizing Contract –Preferred EAP*

Mr. Reynolds and Mr. Callahan sponsored Resolution No. 2019-002 that authorized to execute an agreement with Preferred EAP for Employee Assistance Services.

Voting AYE: Mr. Martell, Ms. Negrón, Mr. Reynolds, Dr. Van Wirt, Mr. Callahan, Mr. Colón, and Mr. Waldron, 7. The Resolution passed.

C. *Authorizing Emergency Operations Plan – Updating City Officials*

Mr. Reynolds and Mr. Callahan sponsored Resolution No. 2019-003 that authorized to adopt the City of Bethlehem Emergency Operations Plan dated January 1, 2019.

Voting AYE: Mr. Martell, Ms. Negrón, Mr. Reynolds, Dr. Van Wirt, Mr. Callahan, Mr. Colón, and Mr. Waldron, 7. The Resolution passed.

Motion – considering Resolutions 10 D through 10 F as a group

Mr. Callahan and Mr. Colón moved to consider Resolutions 10 D through 10 F as a group.

Voting AYE: Mr. Martell, Ms. Negrón, Mr. Reynolds, Dr. Van Wirt, Mr. Callahan, Mr. Colón, and Mr. Waldron, 7. The Motion passed.

D. *Certificate of Appropriateness – 134-136 West Fourth Street (Tasty China)*

Mr. Reynolds and Mr. Callahan sponsored Resolution No. 2019-004 that granted a Certificate of Appropriateness to install a new box light sign (no illumination) and replace previous window stickers at 134-136 West Fourth Street (Tasty China).

E. *Certificate of Appropriateness – 736 East Fourth Street (Las Americas Bakery)*

Mr. Reynolds and Mr. Callahan sponsored Resolution No. 2019-005 that granted a Certificate of Appropriateness to re-vinyl the existing sign face at 736 East Fourth Street (Las Americas Bakery).

F. *Certificate of Appropriateness – 217 Broadway (ReV-el)*

Mr. Reynolds and Mr. Callahan sponsored Resolution No. 2019-006 that granted a Certificate of Appropriateness to install a new sign at 217 Broadway (ReV-el).

Voting AYE on Resolutions 10 D through 10 F: Mr. Martell, Ms. Negrón, Mr. Reynolds, Dr. Van Wirt, Mr. Callahan, Mr. Colón, and Mr. Waldron, 7. The Resolutions passed.

11. NEW BUSINESS

Council Rules

Mr. Callahan related that each time a new Member comes on City Council we are asked by them to be more responsive to people at Public Comment. For the first few years that he was on Council, he does not know if was a precedent or a rule, but Council never did respond back to residents' comments. It is the public's time and their five minutes to give their opinion on something. Mr. Callahan did not always agree with this. When he joined Council he asked a few people and the former Administration why Council cannot comment back to some of the people. Tonight and over the last few weeks he has been trying to do that a little bit more. It appears some of the people do not like us commenting back to what has been said. A good example of why we should not be doing that is what happened with President Waldron tonight. He corrected a statement by a resident and the resident came back and wanted to have a debate. This is not a debate; it is the public's five minutes to give an opinion on something and not an additional five minutes to put the Council President in an awkward position. Mr. Callahan stated we on Council are supposed to have a debate and discuss things among us; that is our job. We are not supposed to be rubber stamps for anything, especially the Historic Board. He noted 99.99% of the time we have accepted the Historic Boards ideas, comments and opinions. On those few times we have it is generally a big project and there is a lot of discussion that occurs. He related not everyone agrees with votes, but it is not right to accuse people of criminal activity. Mr. Callahan referenced comments on Council that were recently made stating there was an illegal transfer of the \$800,000 dollars of RDA money. He asserted there was nothing illegal about the transfer. There is nothing illegal going on here and to assume that people on Council are unethical is wrong. He continued to say there is a resident who attends Council meetings once in a while who goes on blogs and has a

wonderful biography about himself. He noted the individual who criticizes the Mayor and Council for unethical behavior was an employee who is no longer with the City due unethical behavior and workplace violence. Mr. Callahan stated he does not agree with the Mayor all of the time, but he is the most decent and moral person Mr. Callahan has ever met. If someone on Council says something to him, he does not mind that. He challenges anyone to look at the minutes and find anything where he or where anybody else broke decorum during discussions. Mr. Callahan stressed he may not agree with everybody but he does respect everyone's opinion. We are here to debate and discuss and deliberate and come to a conclusion. He stressed the importance of stating correct facts when posting on blogs. He finds it unprofessional that someone is criticizing Council and the Mayor for things that are not unethical. He noted that Mr. Rij had the right to come here. He followed the process, just like the other residents will probably follow the process to go to court. Mr. Callahan remarked we did our job, but do not accuse us of being unethical. He noted the great thing about newspapers is they have a reporter but they also have an editor and publisher who makes sure that the story is balanced and not just one sided. Mr. Callahan agrees with President Waldron that we should have free speech and that is what we are here for.

Dr. Van Wirt stated she does disagree, but does not want to make a mountain out of a mole hill. The reason she brings this up is that she is upset with herself for not having said something when she perceived a personal attack on somebody on Council. She does believe that if that happens again, she is allowed to raise a point of order. She queried if that is correct.

Solicitor Spirk stated, yes anytime any member perceives a potential violation of Robert's Rules the proper way to do that is to raise a point of order and seek recognition.

Dr. Van Wirt informed people are confusing First Amendment rights with an agreement to follow Robert's Rule of Order in a parliamentary procedure. You can say whatever you want, but keep it within Robert's Rules. It is not a way of editing speech; it is a way of containing it so it does not involve personal attacks on people so that we do not get bogged down in personalities and stuff like that. The things she is asking that we follow are that we keep our speeches at 10 minutes each; we have no personal attacks saying "you do not understand " or "you" did this, that is what Robert's Rules of Orders are about in terms of conduct. Dr. Van Wirt continued if someone is going to speak again for a second time, everyone else needs to have had their turn first. Addressing President Waldron she remarked this whole thing she is bringing up is not for political reasons. Dr. Van Wirt continued to say one of the reasons she got up here is because she went to a Committee of the Whole Meeting and was appalled at the conduct on Council. That was one of the reasons she decided to run as a write-in candidate. She does think there are reasons why we need to follow the rules that we agreed to that are not covered by specific Bethlehem City Council rules. Those are the conduct rules within Robert's Rules of Order. Dr. Van Wirt noted that is what she is requesting and she thinks it is a healthy debate to have about this. The final thing she will say is at the last Council Meeting she made a motion to table. She thinks everyone realized she was not trying to table the zoning text amendment, which in parliamentary procedure means kill it totally. That is not what she was asking. She was asking for time to analyze the data she had been given at 8:30 am that morning so that we could all understand what we were passing and voting on and what the impact would be on the City. She did not want to table it, but that is on her because she does not have all of the terms down right. She meant to delay or postpone, but nobody spoke up at that point. We adhered to Robert's Rules of Order then because we did not have any debate on her motion to table. She just asks if we will follow it, we follow it not to the T, but with commonsense and dignity so we can get the job done up here that applies equally to all people in all motions.

Mr. Callahan stated there was a comment made of how terrible the south side of Bethlehem is and how dilapidated and rundown it is because there is a lot of student housing and that an individual was moving out of the south side because of that. He was offended by that. He remarked if it hit someone personally he does apologize because he did not mean that. Mr. Callahan noted this Mayor, the previous Mayor and probably the last ten years of Council have spent an enormous amount of time, energy and money trying to help and fix up the south side. He noted whether it was Hayes Street or all the new facades that are being put in or whether it is the Casino or Levitt Pavilion, ArtsQuest or Channel 39, all the new lighting on Third and Fourth Streets, we did spend an enormous amount of money. He feels it is wrong to criticize those efforts. The west side of Bethlehem gets nothing, but this year they did get \$100,000 dollars for the Rose Garden and that was a debate. Mr. Callahan pointed out we are putting enormous amounts of revenue, development, projects, and the CRIZ on the south side. He was offended and sorry if someone does not agree with what he has to say, but he did not agree on what was said. He expressed he has the right to voice that opinion. We are here to debate and discuss things. He will ask for his two comment periods and hopes we all have a debate back with him about it. This is democracy and that is what some on Council ran on, a more open government.

Mr. Reynolds added that part of this conversation is not even about Robert's Rules or about the First Amendment. It is just from a point of view of Council and something he has learned from being on Council for eleven years. There have certainly been times where he has said things that he wishes he could go back and say differently or maybe he did not say things he wanted to. He realized a long time ago when he first came to City Council Meetings that the most important thing in this room is the relationships that people on City Council have with each other, the relationships that City Council has with the Mayor and with the Administration and with the citizens. If he has a disagreement with Mr. Waldron, they are both still okay to sit down a few weeks from now and talk about the next issue. Mr. Reynolds believes that is the kind of interaction we have although there are different personalities on Council and the Administration. He pointed out there is also a lot of history in these relationships, but the one thing that this body would be wise to remember is there is the right thing to do and the strategic way to do things when we want to tackle problems. We need to walk away from a conversation or debate saying he or she feels different than I do, but I am comfortable sitting down with that person in the future. Mr. Reynolds has learned that there is always another debate, there is always another issue and always something else and we do have to be able to handle that. Over his eleven years he has said things or felt defensive or has felt attacked when people accuse him of things and he did not always respond in the way he wished he would have. The number one thing for us to remember is the importance of the relationships we have with each other. We should be careful about the words we use because sometimes those words can damage that ability to discuss issues. The one question we should ask ourselves is if we have a disagreement with somebody, if next time there is an issue can I sit down with that person for 45 minutes or an hour and have a rational debate. This body has done that for a long time. He knows everybody here cares about the City of Bethlehem and that should be the goal for us. If we look at that as the goal and the question we are trying to answer, many of those questions go away if we are more concerned about maintaining those relationships going forward.

President Waldron thanked Mr. Reynolds for his experience in putting this in perspective. Ultimately, at the end of the day, it helps that we all remember that we are all here for the same greater good of Bethlehem. Regardless of how we get to that path, it is important that we keep an eye on that. If, from time to time there is a little friction, that is only because there is just a difference of opinion. We need to separate that opinion from that person because the person is not made up of

their opinions, those are just the beliefs they have at that moment because they are always evolving and always changing as do his. President Waldron noted not everything is black and white. There is a lot of gray in between and always a different perspective and a different side to every story. He thinks if we keep that in mind moving forward as we tackle some tough decisions in 2019 we will be in a good position because the City is doing quite well, which the Mayor will touch on in his State of the City speech. President Waldron looks forward to working with everybody this coming year.

12. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 8:00 p.m.

ATTEST:

City Clerk