

SPECIAL MEETING OF BETHLEHEM CITY COUNCIL

10 East Church Street - Town Hall

Bethlehem, Pennsylvania

Thursday, March 1, 2018 - 7:00 PM

1. ROLL CALL

President Waldron called the Special City Council Meeting to order. The purpose of the Special City Council Meeting is to fill the vacancy on Bethlehem City Council, as a result of the resignation of Eric R. Evans, former Member of City Council, who was appointed the Business Administrator of the City of Bethlehem effective Monday, February 5, 2018. The individual appointed by City Council this evening shall serve until a successor is elected and sworn into office and that term will run until Monday, January 6, 2020. Present were: Bryan G. Callahan, Michael G. Colón, Shawn M. Martell, Olga Negrón, J. William Reynolds and Adam R. Waldron, 6.

President Waldron informed the process that City Council put in place to fill the vacancy on Council included the development of questions by Council Members for candidates to answer. We came up with 14 questions and interested Bethlehem residents were given the opportunity to submit a letter of interest, resume, and answers to the questions, if so desired, from January 26 until February 9. All responses were sent to the Members of City Council, and the answers to the questions from those who submitted them were posted on the City Council page on the City's website. A special City Council Meeting was scheduled for this evening, March 1, 2018 with a backup date of Monday, March 5, 2018 to nominate and elect a new Member of City Council. The meeting dates were published in the newspaper and on the City's website. President Waldron explained the individual selected tonight will be sworn into office by Northampton County President Judge Stephen Baratta at the beginning of the meeting on Tuesday, March 6, 2018 and they will take their seat at the Council table that evening.

President Waldron stated that under Agenda Item 2, Public Comment, City Council will accept comments from the Public on any subject not being voted on by Council this evening with a 5 minute time limit. Under Agenda Item 3, Public Comment, City Council will accept comments on the matter of filling the Vacant City Council Seat with a 5 minutes time limit. Under Agenda Item 4, City Council will accept remarks from the candidates with a 5 minute time limit. Candidates will be called in alphabetical order by last name. President Waldron advised there are four applicants; there were five but one of them has asked to be taken out of contention. Under Agenda Item 5, Nominations, the President will ask Members of Council for nominations; no second is required. Before we do that Council Members will have the opportunity to make remarks in support of their candidate. At the end of Nominations, the President will ask if there are any further nominations; if not, the President will declare that the nominations are closed. The Clerk will state the names of candidates who received nominations and the Clerk will call the roll. The Council Members will state the name of the candidate for whom they intend to cast their vote. We would need three votes this evening of the six voting members to have a winner and name that person. In the event of a tie it gets a little bit trickier. President Waldron deferred to City Council Solicitor John J. Spirk to walk Council Members through the process if we come to a 3 to 3 tie this evening.

Solicitor Spirk explained that Council has 30 days from the date of the vacancy to fill the vacancy on Council. If Council fails to do that then the Northampton County Court of Common Pleas fills the vacancy and they are not limited in any way as to whom they choose. You may recall from recent experience several years ago on filling the vacancy of the Controller that Council took a number of ballots and was unable to select someone. The Court made the decision and they chose an individual who had not received one vote on any of those ballots. So when the Court takes over the decision, if Council fails to select someone, they can pick anyone. Solicitor Spirk added that there is a safety net under the Third Class City Code, if there is a 3 to 3 deadlock that cannot be broken and we are up against a 30 day deadline. It is the one and only time that the Mayor in a Third Class City gets to vote, and he gets to cast the tie breaking vote of one of those two individuals who would then be selected. Solicitor Spirk believes that the Mayor had indicated to the City Clerk's Office today if that event should happen, he would choose not to vote and would allow the matter to be decided by the Court. The Third Class City Code is very clear. It says that he may choose to vote, so it is permissive and he would be within his rights to decline to exercise that power. Three votes wins if it is more than anyone else, like being 3 to 2 to 1, or 3 to 1 to 1 to 1. But with a 3 to 3 tie, if that cannot be broken by Council by the end of the 30th day, we go to the Court.

President Waldron clarified; it is our intention this evening to do our best to name that person to fill that role. We are able to take multiple rounds of ballots in the event of a tie with deliberation in between. That would be the extent of our process this evening. The last step would be under Agenda Item 6, Resolution. The Members of Council will vote on the Resolution with the name of the individual to fill the vacant City Council seat effective immediately and being sworn in next Tuesday, March 6, 2018 before the Council Meeting.

Mr. Reynolds queried if we received anything in writing from the Administration. He wondered what the source is of the Mayor declining if there was a tie.

President Waldron explained that Mayor Donchez spoke with the City Clerk, not him directly today, to state that he would be deferring to Northampton County Court and not using his power to vote this evening.

Mr. Reynolds asked if that is something the Mayor is allowed to do.

Solicitor Spirk replied yes, the statute says he may choose to or not to. He explained by analogy, under the Borough code, the Mayor in Boroughs can break any tie on any issue, not just filling a vacancy, just any vote on any Ordinance. Under the Borough Code the language says the Mayor may break the tie; if he chooses not to then there has to be a new Borough Council Meeting scheduled to give Council one more chance to break the tie. If they fail to do it then, it says the Mayor of the Borough shall break the tie. The legislature clearly understood the difference between "may" and "shall" in the Borough Code, so it is his opinion when they use the term "may" here in the Third Class City Code, it is optional.

Mr. Reynolds queried if we received a reason as to why he is choosing not to, if that would come up.

Solicitor Spirk stated he does not know directly, but it is his understanding that the City Clerk's Office said the Mayor was respecting the separation of powers.

Mr. Reynolds was just curious and queried if we have anything in writing about this subject.

City Clerk Louise Kelchner stated no.

Mr. Callahan wondered which Court this would go to.

Solicitor Spirk stated the Northampton County Court of Common Pleas with nine judges there; they would have a meeting and vote to make a choice.

Mr. Callahan mentioned that would just be based on their own personal preferences with no criteria for them to look to make a determination.

Solicitor Spirk stated that is correct.

President Waldron noted the only criteria would be that you are 18 years of age and lived in the City for one year.

President Waldron explained we have been through this process not too long ago in 2014 to fill a few vacancies for City Council and in 2015 to fill the vacancy of the Controller. President Waldron noted that he, Mr. Reynolds and Mr. Callahan all participated in that process. Luckily when we took those votes it passed on the first vote, not unanimously, but enough to have a strong majority in order to satisfy that. So we did not have to rely on that vote of the Mayor or potentially Northampton County, other than what Solicitor Spirk references five or six years ago when there was a deadlock for Controller. President Waldron stated it is hopefully the will of Council this evening to come to a resolution and to settle it this evening. Before we start the public comment he will look to other Members of Council for any questions or clarification on the process this evening.

Ms. Negrón queried whether the Northampton County Court of Common Pleas could pull a name of anyone in the City of Bethlehem.

Solicitor Spirk stated yes he can.

2. PUBLIC COMMENT (on any subject not being voted on by Council this evening - 5 minute time limit)

Armory Project/Roberts Rules

Bill Scheirer, 1890 Eaton Avenue informed at the last Council Meeting he may have violated Roberts Rules of Order, newly revised which he regrets. On a lighter note he has thought of a fifth reason why some folks favor larger developments than other folks. As you know Bethlehem was once a gritty manufacturing town that would not have made anyone's list of best places to live, best places to retire in or best places to start a business. When he returned to Bethlehem 15 years ago all that had changed to his pleasant surprise. It seems that he is constantly meeting people who have moved here in the last ten years. It gives him a warm and fuzzy feeling to know that other people also see the qualities that Bethlehem has today. Mr. Scheirer noted if more people come it could mean larger development. He asserted that is larger

apartment blocks that can change the essential character of a neighborhood, as in the case of the Armory. At a certain point there is a limit to the warmth and fuzziness that some of us can feel but feeling instead that more of what is attracting people is slipping away as it becomes denser and more intense. But other people may not feel this way and in fact may not value as much the same qualities of life that we do. Mr. Scheirer added that quite possibly he has not met anyone as organized and focused as Paige Van Wirt, she would be a real addition to the Council. He is a little nonplussed about the rules that have been announced in case there is a 3 to 2 to 1 vote. His understanding is that it would go to the person who got the 3 votes. That is not his feeling about Roberts Rules but perhaps the Solicitor can point him to something after the meeting. That is because say the person with the one vote favored as a second choice the person with two votes, if you have what is known as instant runoff or preferential balloting, that would have resulted in a 3 to 3 tie. So he urges caution in that respect. Mr. Scheirer added with reference to the vote of Controller which was 2 to 2 to 2 and Council voted 8 times and it stayed the same for every vote. There were obviously three persons getting votes but there was a fourth person who had been nominated but did not get any votes. It then went to the Northampton County Court and the person who had been nominated but did not get any votes was the one who was selected by the Court. That is perhaps because he was the only CPA in the group.

Zoning Hearing Board

Bruce Haines, 63 West Church Street explained this morning he sent an email, as did Frank Boyer, to each on Council as well as the Mayor, regarding deep concerns about what happened last night at the Zoning Hearing Board. He stated in our opinion the City kind of undercut the new short term rental Ordinance that you passed last month wherein they are attempting to move transient guests that are staying in apartments or unoccupied homes out of the residential districts of the City and into the commercial districts of the City. Last night he believes that the City misled the Zoning Hearing Board regarding that and the Zoning Hearing Board essentially approved an apartment rental situation that is an Airbnb on Church Street, instead of being a short term rental license converted it into a bed and breakfast. In fact, the person renting the apartment in the back of the house has no intention to welcome those people into her space, into the common area that we all know of as a bed and breakfast, such as the Bethlehem Inn and the Morning Star that used to be here. Mr. Haines noted effectively they let an apartment renter on Airbnb be considered a bed and breakfast operation; there was no intent for this homeowner to cook breakfast for anybody or quite frankly ever see the person who checks in to the apartment. Mr. Haines really thinks that it totally undercut by moving it over from a short term rental to making it be a bed and breakfast that the Zoning Hearing Board approve, that totally undercut the whole concept and intent of the short term rental. There will be more on this but he just wanted to get this on the record here tonight. Mr. Haines would welcome any questions that you might have about this.

Council Vacancy

Stephen Antalics, 737 Ridge Street noted by virtue of his age he has been around for quite a few of these sessions we will have tonight with replacing a Member of Council with the same procedures. What he found amusing is that there is a principle in the Democratic system where elected officials by virtue of the fact that they were elected by the citizens should reflect the will of the people. It seems that in the past selections of replacement of a vacancy, that has never happened where the people had a clear choice and it was overlooked by Council for whatever

reason they have. Mr. Antalics mentioned what he found really interesting is the fact that way back when, Ms. Negrón stood here and asked to be chosen as the replacement and she was a popular choice of the people in the audience. She was not selected for whatever reason was in the minds of the people making the choice then. But since she was not chosen, Ms. Negrón has seen fit to run for the office through the electoral system to let the people of Bethlehem know who their best choice is. Ms. Negrón received the highest vote of any candidate who ran for Council. She was the best candidate in the minds of the citizens. He will ask Council to be responsible to us, and to treat the candidate the way the Council that time should have treated Ms. Negrón.

President Waldron stated just as a reminder there are two Members of Council currently that applied for vacancies.

3. PUBLIC COMMENT (for public comment on the matter of filling the Vacant City Council Seat, with a 5 minute time limit)

Carol Ritter Endorsement

Donald C. Flad Jr., 231 East Market Street stated he is at this meeting on behalf of no organization or company, he is speaking for himself. He believes his thoughts represent the interests of the majority of the citizens of our fair City and that you need to appoint a thoughtful and agenda free person to City Council. This would be someone who does not think he or she has all of the answers up front, someone who is willing to listen and learn from all of the City stakeholders and vote accordingly to the City's best interests. Mr. Flad is a 34 year resident of the historic downtown and a lifelong resident of the Lehigh Valley, he was born in Easton. He has been involved in politics and community activism since the eighth grade and he has never known anyone more qualified and ready to serve on Bethlehem City Council than Carol Ritter. Professionally her company has raised hundreds of thousands of much needed funds for local charities and non-profits and has taken countless small businesses to the next level. She is a nationally recognized motivational speaker. Mr. Flad advised for as long as he has known Carol Ritter which has been decades, she has always put Bethlehem first. Whether it is walking down Main Street, Broad Street, Third Street or Fourth Street with Carol it is like walking with a celebrity because everyone knows her and her name and she knows everyone on those streets and knows all the stories about their businesses. Mr. Flad stated he is deeply engaged with comings and goings of the City but Carol Ritter makes him look like he has only lived here a few years. Carol has no personal agenda, she has no ax to grind, and she only wants to see the City she loves so much continue to moves forward. So Mr. Flad is here tonight asking for your support for Carol Ritter for City Council.

Cindy Glick, 226 Flagstone Drive, stated she has known Carol Ritter for about 20 years or so. She met her first professionally when she was working at Just Born as the Corporate Affairs Manager and Carol was very involved in the community at that time. Ms. Glick added she has worked with Ms. Ritter on numerous councils, committees, projects and has always found her to be very professional, ethical, and someone she is proud to say is a friend. Ms. Glick is at this Council Meeting to express her support for Carol Ritter whom she knows to be a tireless advocate for the community and someone with an open mind and open agenda and a big heart.

Dr. Paige Van Wirt Endorsement

Barbara Diamond, 425 Center Street informed she is at this meeting in support of Dr. Paige Van Wirt. Ms. Diamond believes she would be the best person to fill this position due to her considerable expertise in areas important to municipal governments. She has a graduate degree and work experience in urban planning and work experience in municipal finance. Ms. Diamond added that in addition she is a small business owner who along with her partner established an innovative medical practice that largely serves seniors residing in area nursing homes. As a physician and small business owner in an industry that is highly regulated she would bring important insights of value to the Council. Further, she would bring the perspective of a woman, a perspective that is underrepresented on the current Council. Ms. Diamond understands the argument that it would not be fair to give someone who is not elected the advantage of incumbency but that is not the case here because Dr. Van Wirt did run for the seat and received 1,700 write in votes. That indicated that Bethlehem voters expressed their preference for her to serve on the Council. That vote tally is comparable to the votes Council candidates received from Northampton County in the Primary. Had Mr. Evans resigned his seat before the election, she would almost certainly have been elected. Ms. Diamond does not think you could find a more appropriate person to fill the seat. You may be able to find a woman, a business woman, a woman who has had a leadership role in government or non-profit but it is doubtful that any candidate would combine Dr. Van Wirt's experience and education relevant to municipal government.

Steve Diamond, 425 Center Street explained he is at this meeting to support Paige Van Wirt. He would like to say that the City Council does the business of the people and like a good business they listen to their customers. So how do you know what your customers want, is it a decision from top down or do you go out to the people and find out what they really want. A good business usually forms focus groups, they go out and listen. We already had our focus group in November, when 1,700 people went through the trouble of not to just pull a lever but they went out of their way to write in the name of Paige Van Wirt. Recently, Lehigh Valley Live had a poll and he may agree this is not too professional, but she got 40% of the vote. She is a person who put in her time and energy because she wants to serve. Mr. Diamond advised she is a professional who serves as a physician and cares about people but even more importantly she has a background in City planning and a background in finance. Mr. Diamond believes her perspectives will bring a positive to the City Council.

Ziona Brotleit, 412 Second Avenue, explained she is at this meeting to speak on behalf of Paige Van Wirt and would like to see her in the vacated position for many of the same reasons. She is highly qualified as a small business owner, a person with experience in municipal finance, urban planning and her involvement in City and County government as a citizen. She has a long record of performance with high integrity and her knowledge base as a physician will inform best practices for handling our devastating opioid crisis. Ms. Brotleit noted that Paige Van Wirt received 1,700 write in votes and that speaks the minds of your constituents that she was written in. She will work well with City Council and will work on building bonds between you and creating a good working environment for all of you to put your best qualities forward. Ms. Brotleit looks forward to seeing Paige Van Wirt on Council and hopes you feel the same.

4. PRESENTATION BY CANDIDATES (5 minute time limit) (In alphabetical order)

Carol Ritter, 419 Dewberry Avenue stated that she was born and raised in Bethlehem. She noted that Bethlehem has always been the place to live, work and play. In the early years we remember the Boyd Theater, the Orr's Department Store and the Union Bank and Trust Company where she began her career. But today we have ArtsQuest, we have the Levitt Pavilion, the National Museum of Industrial History, the Bethlehem Public Library with the new children's center, Musikfest and of course the Historic Hotel Bethlehem. Ms. Ritter continued to say that leadership and change have been a constant in Bethlehem, the north side offering the important unique and historical legacy and the new south side arts district bringing a fresh combination of arts, music, theater and small business working together. Ms. Ritter informed her leadership role and experiences on a State, Local and National level have taught her how to work on a team, how to lead a team and most importantly how to deliberate in a fair way and move toward a solution on any issue. She believes in five basic leadership principles. Number one, inspiring others, she does not believe you can inspire anyone unless you know them and understand them. Having said that, the ability to walk in constituent's shoes is critical in inspiring them to get involved and participate in this great City. Community involvement can be a catalyst for strengthening the bond between elected officials and the citizens. Educating the public leads to trust and trust leads to involvement. Ms. Ritter stated number two is embracing change. When she asks people what they think of change they always give the same answer, they love it, they hate it, and it is inevitable. Change has been the backbone of the City for decades but change needs to be done with careful consideration of all the facts and then ask yourself how will this impact the community. As a City Council woman she would pledge to embrace change while considering what is good for the City but what is most importantly good for the citizens. Ms. Ritter continued to say that number three would be that partnerships matter. She attended the Mayor's breakfast last week and was impressed by the progress of the City. More than that she was impressed by the partnerships mentioned in his speech and in her career she shared some of those same partnerships. She has worked with the Bethlehem Area School District, Lehigh University, Moravian College, Lehigh Valley Health Network, Northampton Community College and St. Luke's where she served as board chair for the St. Luke's VNA and Hospice. Ms. Ritter pointed out, if you want to make a difference, create change, build a community, enhance a city and create strong neighborhoods; the best way to do it with partners with expertise and commitment. She would like to think of ambassadorship and noted when she was working for the Library she trained employees how to go from being a librarian, to being an ambassador for the Library. She learned that it is not easy to do; it is very difficult to get somebody out of their comfort zone. She sees the current Council as completely dedicated to the City and you are in fact strong community ambassadors, but the next step could be to create more ambassadors. How do you identify people of influence in the community who love and live in Bethlehem? Influence can be a catalyst for getting more people involved in City government and service to the community. Number five is active listening. Ms. Ritter reflected possibly the most important thing she will say tonight is to practice active listening. She has no set agendas, gathering all of the facts, collaborating with the experts, working with the Council to make educated informed decisions. She has spent the last fifteen years working with local businesses, hundreds of citizens and community organizations and she is deeply invested and committed to this City and would like to be a part of helping it continues to grow and prosper. Ms. Ritter thanked Council and the staff for the professionalism in making this process not only interesting, but educational and fair. In conclusion, she would love the opportunity to serve her favorite City in the whole world. She is

ready and willing to listen, to learn and truly has no preset agenda moving forward. She respectfully asks for your vote tonight.

Lynn Rothman, 870 Wafford Lane explained she has great pride in our City of Bethlehem and while we are not fixed in our past we do not ignore it as we advance in the 21st century. As a citizen invested in the long term prosperity of the City she relishes the opportunity to serve as a member of City Council and work with a diverse group of citizens helping to make a positive difference. Ms. Rothman pointed out her interests and background are well suited to a position on City Council. Her educational background in government, geology, hydrology, and public decision making models, work experience with the Federal government and volunteer experience in the non-profit world have given her a wide range of skills. Ms. Rothman stated time at the Environmental Protection Agency and the Army Corp of Engineers gave her an appreciation for balancing environmental protection, land use and development. Having worked for the Federal government she appeared before citizens at town meetings, listened to their passion regarding property rights and their view on the impacts of proposed highways, issuance of building permits and wetlands and mandatory wetland mitigation on their properties. Government, especially local government has a very direct effect on a person's life. She welcomes the opportunity to have an impact on the lives of our citizens, keeping in mind that there is always a balance between the individual and the greater good. Ms. Rothman added that a Member of City Council leads and supports amendments to local Ordinances, introduces legislation, appoints members of committees, approves the budget and listens to and acts upon the concerns and suggestions of constituents. These are the types of functions she performed as president of a large Synagogue as well as being ultimately responsible for the Temples finances including facilities operations, salaries and health benefits for our staff. Ms. Rothman explained that most recently she has been serving as Chair of the Bethlehem Environmental Advisory Council (EAC). In 2016 we successfully updated our bylaws and through our work on the EAC she has learned about many issues affecting the City such as recycling, the new parking garage, climate action plan, and solar Ordinances. In addition, chairing the EAC has given her the opportunity to work with Members of City Council, interact with City departments, environmental organizations and the public as well as represent the EAC at meetings pertaining to environmental issues. For example, she has attended meetings of the Bethlehem Citizens Traffic Advisor Council, worked with Councilman Reynolds and Assistant City Clerk Robert Vidoni on the Climate Action Plan and she is a member of the Climate Action Plan Working Group. She actively participated in the initiative to join the north and south sides of Bethlehem with the dedicated pedestrian bicycle bridge and attended other community gatherings such as Renew Lehigh Valley Summits, Sierra Club events and Lehigh Valley Watershed conferences. In addition, she completed the course in Community Planning and attended public meetings through the Lehigh Valley Planning Commission. This community involvement strengthens her candidacy. Ms. Rothman has learned to approach issues with an open mind knowing the importance of listening to all sides. She enjoys the give and take involved with decision making and believes that sometimes the best solutions come from opposite sides working together. Ms. Rothman brings to Council her ability to consider all aspects of an issue and work towards consensus combined with her confidence to stand up for what she believes is right. She was a member of the inaugural class of Mayor Callahan's citizen's academy in 2009 and during the 10 weeks she learned about the inner workings of Bethlehem City and met people of all ages and walks of life who shared an interest in our community. Since that time she has been present at many City Council Meetings. Ms. Rothman stated she now has the time and energy to devote to giving back to the community where we have had the good fortune to live and raise our children. Referencing her application, she pointed out letters of

recommendation and support from members of the EAC and members of the community at large were submitted, which she is sure Council will take into consideration when making a decision. Ms. Rothman thanked Council for their time during this process and dedication to the City of Bethlehem.

Clyde Thomas, 315 Hamilton Avenue stated he comes to this meeting with no prepared remarks but wanted to say he thanks Council for the process for filling this position. This was a fair process; it gives everybody an opportunity to express how they feel the future of the City shall be run the next several years. Mr. Thomas added as he said in his application, he has no plans to run in two years and has no plans to run in the next two cycles at least for City Council. So his serving on Council would be for two years only and after that he will support whoever is nominated for the City Council seat. He will remain Chair of the Bethlehem Democratic City Committee as long as he is voted in either next June or the following February depending on how their bylaws are changed in the next few months. In the event that he is still remains Chair of the Bethlehem City Committee he will not be able to endorse a candidate during the Primary so he thinks if he was put on Council he would basically be an independent person. Mr. Thomas does have a strong desire to serve his community and he has demonstrated that his whole life. Since graduating college in 1985 he was very active in his hometown of Somerville, New Jersey where he lived until he was 44 and he then moved to Bethlehem. In that time he ran for Council twice and was not elected. He narrowly lost the first time and lost large the second time, so he knows how it feels to be defeated and if that happens today he will be graceful and congratulate the person selected. Mr. Thomas pointed out that we need to help the citizens of Bethlehem grow and improve with the City of Bethlehem. If on Council he would like to propose that any type of development that citizens want to do to improve their properties that would increase their property value, he would like to see a deferment overtime so it would be a gradual increase of property tax on those improvements. He would also like to see more analytical methods to determine our road speeds and road usage. There are some areas where we can look at traffic and the speed on certain roads and do some internal traffic studies to monitor the roads to have some road calming measures put in. Mr. Thomas pointed out those are the two things he would work on for the next two years if chosen. He thanked Council for their time and added that he is sure their decision will be a fair and equitable one whatever it is and added he does appreciate all Council does.

Paige Van Wirt, 42 West Market Street thanked Council for the time they have given tonight to listen to all the applicants. She remarked here we are all in the rotunda at the very bedrock of our political process, at the municipal level trying to get it right. This is what she absolutely is passionate about, civic pride and civic responsibility. She believes problems are solved best at the local level and Cities work the best when we work to take care of our own. For example, she volunteered for 7 years at the rescue mission clinic on Hamilton Boulevard providing medical care for homeless people, she wants to take care of our own. She continued many of you have a good sense of her background and her experiences so she wanted to talk tonight about the ideals she has for what a strong municipal government can bring to a City, what we have in Bethlehem, and how to build on that foundation. Dr. Van Wirt pointed out a conservative pundit said recently "We Republicans may not be the nicest people in the room but we make the machines hum." She thinks in his and many people's minds is that you cannot have it both ways. To have a government that believes in social justice as well as fiscal responsibility is like a bed sheet, if you pull it too hard one way then the corner is exposed in the other. This thing he said about machines humming stuck with her, first because she could not believe he actually

admitted it and second, because at a deeper level she believes he got it all wrong. She wanted to say, come to Bethlehem and see how we get it right here. There are two forces involved, the ability to enact social justice, or as she like to put it to take care of our own, and the force of fiscal responsibility or how to make the machines hum. Dr. Van Wirt stated she wanted to mention a few examples of how we get it right in Bethlehem. This is by no means a comprehensive list but in terms of protecting and taking care of our own, look what we have done, Lehigh County Commissioner Amy Zanelli legislated protections for LGBTQ people in the Lehigh County work force. Also, the South Side Initiatives and the Historic Architecture Review Board ensure that our neighborhoods and treasures are respected and protected; the CACLV and consortium of churches are taking care of our homeless. Dr. Van Wirt continued to say we also have the Environmental Action Committee working to change how we think about our footprint right here in the Valley. The idea is strong and true that Bethlehem is a sanctuary City and all are welcome here. We historically have taken care of our own from the most vulnerable of citizens to the most cherished of our resources using our ideas, our energy and our wise people and we make the machines hum. Dr. Van Wirt added that previous Administrations and Councils have made brave decisions to bring the Sands into a brownfield in the heart of our City to build ArtsQuest and make Musikfest come alive. The current Administration and this Council has brought our bond rating up to an A plus and that is how you make the machines hum. Fiscal discipline has allowed a balanced budget, and a City Hall that serves the citizens with speed, efficiency and kindness. We have little crime, and a police force that understands the way to relate to and to protect our own. Dr. Van Wirt stated that Bethlehem knows how to make the machines hum. Instead of being a zero sum gain in Bethlehem those traditionally opposed forces of taking care of our own and making the machines hum, they are dynamically connected here. For example, in medicine there is this great cheap little drug that we use in advanced heart failure, and taken on its own it has little affect but give it 30 minutes before the main diuretic, which has often stopped working it causes the second drug to work like crazy, it is a potentiator or an amplifier. That is what those two forces, taking care of our own and making the machines hum do to each other in Bethlehem. They amplify each other, you get the one right and the other gets stronger. If we make the machines really hum it is easier and efficient to take care if our own. If we take care of our own, creating an open and dynamic society based on justice and peace it attracts great people and businesses, making our machines hum. Dr. Van Wirt stated this force holding those two together does not just spring up out of the ground organically; it is created and nurtured by the citizens and the municipal government. This is a relationship that is built on trust, which is trust that you as Council Members will make the decisions that keep that bond between social justice, and making the machines hum tight. It is a belief by citizens that their government is utterly transparent, accessible and accountable. That is the bond, the big piece that is missing in that original statement about the hum of machines. It is a bond between a city and its citizens which must be kept in the most highest of ideals. Dr. Van Wirt pointed out it is a bond that we have, it is a strong foundation that we have in Bethlehem of innovation, public/private partnerships and effective city government. It is up to us to ensure that we build on this model of good government as enormous change is heading towards our city; continuing to build on transparency, accountability and justice so we can keep the machines humming and always we take care of our own. She thanked Council for the time to listen to everything tonight and agrees that this is a good, fair process.

President Waldron thanked all of the applicants who put their name in for this vacancy. It is not easy to expose yourself to this kind of public scrutiny. It is similar, but in many ways different than actually getting out and running for office. When you are running you are trying

to impress one household or person at a time, but when you are doing this it is on a very public forum and is not the most comfortable thing. Unfortunately three people are going to walk away here a little bit disappointed, but he hopes that the process made it transparent and fair and everyone felt that had a good opportunity to express their ideas and thoughts over the past month and this evening.

Mr. Reynolds first wanted to thank all of the candidates and started by thanking all for having last names near the end of the alphabet which means he will not have to sit on the end of the dais anymore, no matter who we pick. He also wanted to thank everyone for coming out and being part of this process. The best thing about tonight is not just the fact that we are picking one of these four great candidates, but it is when you look at each of the four candidate's involvement in our community, all of those contributions are bigger than what City Council does. If you go around the room, you see people that are involved in school PTA's or their church or synagogue, political organizations, small business community and neighborhood associations. This is what makes Bethlehem a great city, and we are lucky to have so many candidates who are so involved in the community. That alone is bigger than this decision we have to make which is obviously difficult. Mr. Reynolds thanked the four candidates for putting their name in and expressing an interest and he also thanked them for reaching out to everybody on City Council. Mr. Reynolds explained he had an opportunity to speak extensively to all four over the past several weeks and as you look at all four of them there are a lot of similarities in what they want to do for the City and what they bring to the City. Mr. Reynolds is comfortable in whatever direction we decide to go in as a Council, and although he does hope it is not a tie, he is comfortable because all four candidates are going to be fantastic Council people. He also gave them credit for the positive manner in which they approached this process. All of the candidates spoke glowingly about the City, the direction of the City and why they love living here. Mr. Reynolds explained it is always inspiring to him when he hears people who moved here from somewhere else and think that Bethlehem has unique qualities that you do not have in other places. He also thanked all of the candidates that spoke about continuing the work that this Council and Administration have begun to do including our Climate Action Plan, Open Data, our transparency efforts, and our Northside 2027 initiative. Mr. Reynolds added he has been on City Council for a while now and his biggest complaint sometimes is the negative tone that occasionally rises when the City faces difficult issues, but that is what democracy is and is unique to the local government. It is not unique to 2018, when you look at the history of Bethlehem and there were arguments on whether or not to build the Hill to Hill Bridge, the City Center or the Casino. You will find people over the years that have very different opinions. Once again, that is why it is democracy. Over the long run Bethlehem gets it right. We know this because our City government continually changes and continually adapts, and we have a community where people want to be involved. We all understand that we are judged as a City not by the decisions that we make and how they are perceived in the next 24 hours, days or months, but how people look back on it. Mr. Reynolds noted when you look at Bethlehem's record over decisions that have been over the last 100 years; especially over the past 20 years since Bethlehem Steel has closed, it is an impressive one. It is hard not to look at that process about how we made those decisions and not think that this should influence our decision here. When Mr. Evans stepped down from City Council the Administration gained a great addition. Mr. Reynolds stated he served with Mr. Evans for eight years on Council and can say for certainty that while he disagreed with Mr. Evans at certain times he was a great Council person. We disagreed on many issues and frequently but there were a ton of things that he respected about Mr. Evans and that continues today. It was the way he went about his job, he was always looking out for the whole City and was willing to sit down for hours

to work through things. Mr. Reynolds noted all the candidates share the same ideas, that we have big priorities such as keeping Bethlehem safe, and how do we keep our budget in line and most importantly finding a way to pay for it all. Those decisions need to be at the forefront of every decision that we make and he knows from his conversations with the candidates that all understand this. This body has also generally been blessed with members who he will say understand the responsibility of “no”. In this job it is easiest to say no, and this was a big criterion for him when he looked at who he wanted to choose. Mr. Reynolds pointed out we have issues where we have multiple groups of people who have self-interests and that is understandable, but our job is to balance those interests, compromise and do what is right for all 75,000 people. That will make people angry and frustrated sometimes. In local government you cannot hide from that and it is not just in this room it is also at the local CVS or at a Liberty football game or on Main Street. Mr. Reynolds mentioned what makes local government difficult sometimes is those people you disagree with. It may be people you went to high school with or people you work with or you live next to; it does not take long before you inevitably disappoint someone you know. All four of these candidates understand that moment is coming for whoever is picked. This job is not easy; you cannot be everything to everybody at all times. Mr. Reynolds explained that government is about finding solutions and solutions involve energy, patience, meeting new colleagues, and understanding the process. The best thing he can say about the four candidates is that he is confident that they all view this job the same way. Mr. Reynolds stated those are the things that have contributed to him making a decision about who he thinks he supports. He stated, everyone here fits all of that criteria, and whatever direction City Council decides to go in, we will be lucky to have the service of that individual. Mr. Reynolds remarked the person he is confident that will be the best at that is Paige Van Wirt, and that is who he will be supporting tonight.

Mr. Colón explained Councilman Reynolds already stated many of the remarks he wanted to make. He thanked everyone for applying and noted that he has gone through this process twice as a candidate in the recent years when we had two vacancies on Council. He submitted his name both times and both times he had a combined zero votes from Members of Council but he does not hold a grudge. Mr. Colón stated he then ran a campaign and here he gets to sit tonight. So even though there will be three people walking out of this room who will not have the support of Council he wishes that no one walks out of this room discouraged because he does encourage everyone if they feel the desire to serve on City Council to put their name on the ballot in 2019 or whenever to continue to participate in the process. He was very fortunate to know all four people on a personal level through different work in the community, and knows that each one of the applicants bring sincerity, integrity, knowledge, and a unique skill set. There is no wrong choice tonight but he does appreciate everyone taking time to come and put themselves out here and be a part of this process. Mr. Colón noted when evaluating everybody there was one person who has prepared themselves for months and received a significant amount of votes from the public in the last election and there is no way he could ignore that, and that person is Paige Van Wirt, and who he will support tonight.

Ms. Negrón mentioned just like Mr. Colón, she put her name in for the past vacancy so she knows what this feels like. We do have four really good candidates, so we better make this decision and not have a tie and not have a judge made a decision for us. Ms. Negrón stated she knows all four candidates and appreciates that they all understand the importance of Council listening to the constituents and sometimes having an agenda really does not matter. It is not about what individual members of Council think; it is about representing the people. Going back

to that it was mentioned that Dr. Paige Van Wirt received 1,700 write in votes in the last election. Ms. Negrón added that there were several citizens who spoke on behalf of Carol Ritter, who has worked with at the Library and who she knows well. We also received many letters of recommendation with 7 letters for Carol Ritter, 8 for Lynn Rothman and 42 for Paige Van Wirt so that is important to her. Ms. Negrón thanked everyone for putting their name forward for this position. Ms. Negrón noted because of her incredible financial background and economic development experience she will be supporting Dr. Paige Van Wirt.

Mr. Callahan also thanked everyone for applying and the citizens of Bethlehem for coming out to this meeting. He was very impressed with all of the candidates. He met with all of them and got the time to get to know them better. Mr. Callahan stated just for clarification from one of the prior speakers, in the past Council tried whenever there were openings to appoint people who they felt they wanted to be on Council to win the next election. He thinks what we tried to do in the last two appointments that we had in the past five years, is we did not want someone who would run in the next election. That was probably the best way. We were not trying to give anyone a leg up in the election, and we wanted the voters to decide. So we had asked in the last two appointments that the people would promise not to run. If we wanted to we could have appointed someone who we thought wanted to run and give them the power of incumbency and the ability to raise a little bit more money. Mr. Callahan added that they would be able to run while they are an incumbent. What we wanted to do was take that off of the table. We wanted people who if they wanted to run everyone started off with a clean slate. So that is why we decided in the last two vacancies not to appoint someone who wanted to run in two years. He just wanted to clarify that. The will is right now that no one cares whether they run in a year and a half or they do not, and so with that off the table, the whole process is wide open. Mr. Callahan stated our job tonight is to appoint the best person for the City of Bethlehem; not to appoint someone who is the best for our future political endeavors. As he sat down with one individual out of all of them there was one person who he felt was above and beyond everyone else, no matter how well everyone else did and they all did a good job. He continued to say that when you look at a community resume that is impressive with the amount of time, and passion that she spends in the City, and anyone that knows this woman knows there is only one agenda on her mind and that is what is best for the City of Bethlehem. She was not trying to sway anybody, she is a consensus builder, and for that reason he will be supporting Carol Ritter tonight.

Mr. Martell thanked everyone who came out for this process, as his colleagues have mentioned. Everyone was correct when they talked about the qualities of all of the candidates and it shows in their commitment and passion for the City of Bethlehem. Because of that this will be a tough call and it would be difficult to make a wrong choice. He expressed everyone who sent in their resume would be able to handle the tasks and issues that we face on City Council. Mr. Martell does think one candidate will be more immediately ready based on her background and experience and involvement in the process, and that would be Paige Van Wirt and that is who he will be supporting.

President Waldron added in reference to Lynn Rothman who has put her name out here three times, she is in distinct company and obviously she is committed to serve the City and does that in the role as Chair of the EAC where she has reinvigorated it and given it some life. Her work there lends itself very well serving Council in her current role, but he does think that at some point she has the support to become a Council Member up here because she would do a

tremendous job. President Waldron thanked all four of the applicants who put their name in this evening because this is not an easy or comfortable thing to do. It does show the respect that you have for your City and I hope that you felt that respect return from Council.

Mr. Reynolds noted for clarification as to Mr. Callahan's point when we had picked Mr. Stellato in January of 2015 he had stated he was not intending to run but when we picked Ms. Reuscher in January/February 2014 she said she was not sure if she would run or not. We did ask that question, but she said she was not sure and the minutes of City Council reflect that as well.

5. NOMINATIONS

President Waldron stated he will accept Nominations for the vacant City Council seat.

Mr. Callahan nominated Carol Ritter

Mr. Reynolds nominated Dr. Paige Van Wirt

President Waldron nominated Lynn Rothman

President Waldron closed the Nominations and asked the City Clerk to read the names of the candidates who received nominations.

The City Clerk stated that the names of the candidates who received nominations are Carol Ritter, Lynn Rothman, Dr. Paige Van Wirt.

President Waldron asked the Clerk to call the roll of the Members of Council, and advised that the Members will vote on the nominees. The Members will state the name of the person they wish to vote for on the first ballot.

Mr. Reynolds voted for Dr. Paige Van Wirt

Mr. Callahan voted for Carol Ritter

Mr. Colón voted for Dr. Paige Van Wirt

Mr. Martell voted for Dr. Paige Van Wirt

Ms. Negrón voted for Dr. Paige Van Wirt

Mr. Waldron voted for Dr. Paige Van Wirt

President Waldron stated that by a 5-1 vote the name of Dr. Paige Van Wirt will be placed on the Resolution on which City Council will vote to fill the vacancy.

6. RESOLUTION

A. Filling Vacant City Council Seat

President Waldron advised that the Clerk will read the Resolution with the name of the individual Dr. Paige Van Wirt, sponsored by Ms. Negrón and Mr. Reynolds.

The Clerk read the Resolution as follows: BE IT RESOLVED by the Council of the City of Bethlehem that pursuant to Third Class City Charter Law Sec. 406 (a) (53 P.S. Sec. 41406 (a)), Paige Van Wirt is hereby appointed to fill the vacancy on Bethlehem City Council, as a result of the resignation of Eric R. Evans who was appointed Business Administrator of the City of Bethlehem effective Monday, February 5, 2018, and who shall so serve until his/her successor is elected and duly sworn into office on Monday, January 6, 2020.

Voting AYE: Mr. Reynolds, Mr. Colón, Mr. Martell, Ms. Negrón, Mr. Waldron, 5. Voting NAY: Mr. Callahan, 1. Resolution 2018-040 was passed 5-1.

President Waldron congratulated Dr. Van Wirt and thanked all of the candidates who applied and submitted letters of interest and resumes.

7. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 8:18 p.m.

ATTEST:

City Clerk